5-2016

Ethnic Media and Changes in Technology: A Secondary Study

Alana Johnson
University at Albany, State University of New York

ETHNIC MEDIA AND CHANGES IN TECHNOLOGY

A SECONDARY STUDY

Alana Johnson

University at Albany, SUNY

Communications Department

Undergraduate Honors Thesis

Acknowledgements

I would like to first thank my mother Marva M. Fletcher for always loving me, protecting me, guiding me, and helping me become the strong woman I am today and for encouraging me to follow my dreams no matter how big.

My friends Courtney Jasmin, Cynthia Louis-Juste, and Macgda Delinois for keeping me encouraged, happy, and loved through the process.

My supervisor Amberly R. Carter for reminding me to always stand up for myself and what I believe in.

My cousin Nadisha T. Skeine and friend Dauminique B. Smalling for being my Guardian Angels.

Most importantly, I'd like to thank God. For I can do all things through Christ who strengthens me.

Table of Contents

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to discover how ethnic media organizations are doing in comparison to mainstream media in terms of keeping up with changes in technology as well as providing suggestions in how they may do so. This paper is a secondary research based on research done by Matthew Matsaganis as well as students from both CUNY Graduate School of Journalism and from the Department of Communication at University at Albany, SUNY. They created a survey that was distributed to and completed by ethnic media organizations and producers who serve immigrant communities across New York City. The research questions focused on in this paper are based on how ethnic media organizations are adapting to the changes in technologies used in media, what ethnic media organizations are doing to accommodate for the growing population of ethnic media consumers especially those that are a part of the younger generation, ways that ethnic media organizations can make content available online, and benefits ethnic media organizations can see in developing a stronger presence online.

Introduction

Mass media includes all forms of information communicated to large groups of people. One specific part or category that falls under mass media is mainstream news media. This includes the news industry and its players. Mainstream news media is often used interchangeably with the press and represents the group of people who research, write about, and report the news. Those that work in news media, also known as journalists, are responsible for deciding what is included, how much time or space is devoted to reporting a news event, and interpreting the facts of news events.

Media saturates a large portion of society making it a very important topic. More often than not, news shapes people's view of the world. "Nearly all of the news in the United States comes from a major network or newspaper…All of these decisions add up to the audience's view of the world…"(Akin, 2005).

The intended focus of this paper is in how technological innovation is shaping the news media industry, specifically in ethnic news media; which is media that is produced by and for members of an ethnic minority or immigrant group which enables these media outlets to cover issues of specific interest to and concern to their audiences (Vikki S. Katz, Matthew D. Matsaganis, & Sandra J. Ball-Rokeach, 2012). Ethnic media gives minority communities who are not well represented in the mainstream news media industry a chance to see news that is targeted towards, as well as created by them. If journalists do in fact help influence the way in which their audiences view the world as mentioned before, minority groups have a right to news media that will portray them and speak to them in ways they can relate to or identify with. Ethnic media is important in helping minorities feel that their communities are important. They need to know that their voices are heard and are being well represented.

Technology has become a very important facet of society and essentially an important part of media. Mass communications has always needed a vehicle. As time goes on, audiences grow larger and certain vehicles of communication become outdated while new vehicles emerge. Some new vehicles include mobile devices and tablets. It is essential that media companies add mobility to their distribution of information. A generation ago, access to information that changed daily was limited to a few locally printed newspapers, very little television channels, and some radio stations. Now, consumers are able to access almost all of the world's news and information wherever and whenever they please ("The Greatest Change in the History of Media," 2013).

With the changes in technology that mainstream media are undergoing, it is important that ethnic media producers also keep up with these changes. Keeping up with these changes may be what determines if these ethnic media organizations and producers are able to continue to be successful and accessible to the communities they intend to serve. The purpose of this paper is to discover if ethnic media producers and organizations are following the technological trends that mainstream media are following and if not what are some recommendations and best practices in order to keep up with these trends.

Literature Review
Changes in Technology: The Beginning

Often times, the definition of technology is based on perspective. This is because there are so many correct definitions of technology. It can be seen as an application of tools and methods; the study development and application of devices, machines, and techniques for manufacturing and productive processes. It can also be defined as a method of applying technical knowledge; a method or methodology that applies technical knowledge or tools. For the purpose

of this paper, we can define technology as a response to a necessity, or desire for change (Miguel F. Aznar, 2005). One of the most useful purposes of technology is in information and communication. With that being said, it is important to talk about how it is continuously changing communication (Kelly Ngyah, n.d.).

Technology is created essentially to make something easier or more efficient. For the most part, technology is a problem solver. Inventors of new technology had a purpose in mind and that purpose was to always to improve upon something or serve as a helping hand. Innovation comes from the constant need or desire to improve. By that I mean there is always change in technology. There is always improvement. The technological revolution in the communications industry is one of the many ways we can see firsthand that technology changes based on the changes in society's needs. We also see that changes in technology are a continuous process. When one method of technology comes out, there is always a way to change the technology or create a new one whose purpose is the same but it is more efficient or does a better job (Miguel F. Aznar, 2005).

The changes in technology in news and print media started with a necessity to get information out to people. In other words, society needed to find a way to communicate to others especially those in far places. Writing letters and sending them out to whomever was a very long process. In this case the problem can be seen as getting information out. The solution then would be any and all of the technologies that were created to help do so. Some of these technologies included the telephone, the telegraph, and the radio.

Before the telephone, all long distance communication that occurred were reliant on the telegraph. In 1835 Samuel Morse began working on Morse code and the telegraph. In 1844, when Henry Clay was nominated as the Whig party's presidential nominee, Morse's partner

Alfred Vail wired the news to the capitol from the Annapolis Junction. This was the first recorded news dispatched by electric telegraph. This was the beginning of news being communicated by different technologies ("'What Hath God Wrought' The House and the Telegraph," n.d.). The problem was solved, but there were ways to make it faster, more efficient, and easier.

Alexander Graham Bell created the telephone as a result of him attempting to improve on the telegraph. Both the telegraph and the telephone are wire based electrical systems. However, the telegraph could only send one message at a time. So the new problem in communications is sending more than one message at a time. The telephone allowed the transfer of more than one message at a time ("Capitol Hill's Telephonic Revolution," n.d.).

The next problem communication was faced with was sending messages to a mass audience. This problem was solved with radio technology. The radio started with the discovery of "radio waves", electromagnetic waves that have the capacity to transmit music, speech, pictures and other data invisibly through the air. It is because of the two previous developments that radio was able to emerge as a form of communication (Mary Bellis, 2015). People were now able to send multiple messages to a large amount of people at once. This could also be accomplished through print media.

The television was revolutionary in communicating to masses. People were able to tune in to news channels to keep updated with what was happening in society. For the purpose of this paper, let's call print, television, and radio; traditional media. As I mentioned before, technology is always changing. Once a problem is solved, there is always a way to change or create technology to further alleviate that problem. Traditional media although not completely outdated like the telegraph, they are becoming less used. PEW Research Center (2013) asked respondents

who received news or headlines "yesterday" from each platform including television newspaper radio online and digital media. Overall, this study shows that the digital news channels are growing in comparison to the traditional media, which are declining. In 2012, the categories "online" and "any digital news" had surpassed both radio and newspaper. This study shows that although they have not been completely abandoned, radio and newspaper are being used a lot less than digital media ("The State of the News Media 2013," 2013).

The Internet has provided a new way to communicate not only one on one but to large audiences as well. News media has adopted this new technology to help communicate to their audiences. Many news outlets now have websites and social media platforms. They have adapted to the ongoing changes in technology in today's society. In today's society everyone is more prone to things that are readily available to them. People would rather go online to read an article or open an app that has small parts of the news story than reading or subscribing to printed newspaper distributors.

According to the American Press Institute (2014), keeping up with the news occurs at different times throughout the day. Thirty-three percent (33%) of those who participated in the study say they allow news at multiple times during the day, 24% said in the morning, 26% reported in the evening, 4% in the afternoon, and 90% right before bed. To keep up with these habits, it is important that news media outlets give consumers access to news 24/7. This gives people the ability to stay updated on the go. A news outlet is able to send a story out to their audience whenever they need to. They don't have to wait for a story to be printed and delivered to their audience's homes. They are also now able to provide audiences with more stories than they would have if they have a limited amount of space. In the 2015 report, the newspaper industry is shown to be suffering financially. While newspaper ad revenue declined 4%, local

television on air ads increased by 7% and digital ad revenue increased by 18% ("The Personal News Cycle: How Americans choose to get their news," 2014).

Taking advantage of being able to use the internet is also less expensive for media outlets. It would cost the New York Times twice as much money to print and deliver the newspaper over a year as it would cost to send people subscribed to NYT online a new Amazon Kindle. The estimate of delivery costs was said to be approximately $644 million. With approximately 830,000 readers who are subscribed to the NYT, another source told Business Insider that their estimate of the New York Times printing cost is very low compared to the actual price (Carlson, 2009).

Mainstream news media has become faster and more accessible to audiences. It is important that mainstream news media keeps up with technological innovation. When society went mobile, news media had to go mobile as well. Had they not, audiences would probably be discouraged from reaching out and staying updated. In fact, according to the state of the news media report, mobile access to news has allowed people to consume more news from more sources. The PEW Research Center's project for excellence in Journalism says that 31% of people reported that they spend more time with news and that they turn to news sources for news. After getting their tablet, 45% reported that they are adding to the news they consume ("The State of the News Media 2013," 2013).

It's a new age in the media world. Numerous researchers have proven in recent years that the one to many top down journalism environment is undergoing a fundamental transformation (Ashuri, 2012). With the newly included realm of social media's role expanding over the past ten years, news is traveling at an extremely fast rate compared to what it was before. Social media can be defined as forms of electronic communication that allow its users to form online

communities that enable them to share information, ideas, personal messages and other content (Lewis, 2014). Social media sites like Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram have helped society express their concerns and raise awareness of political and societal issues. In fact, social networks have become important elements of the distribution systems of mass communication (Heikkilä & Ahva, 2015).

How Technological Changes Change How Journalists do Their Jobs

There is data that suggests that the roles in the newsroom are being redefined due to the adoption of the web and other online technologies (Garrison, 2001). Journalists are increasingly required to learn these new technologies as part of their jobs. The role that journalists play in the is being challenged by different news sources (at times non professional agents), who are using various media and penetrate the journalistic arena. (Ashuri, 2012). With that being said, the nature of the journalists' job is changing as technology changes.

Information is spread faster on social networking sites than any other form of media. In fact, it has been reported that over 50% of people learn about breaking news on social media and social networking sites have become the top news source for 27.8% of Americans while newspapers are at 28.8%, radio is at 18.8% and other print publications are at 6%. Using Social Networking to find stories has become an important and necessary part of the job of a journalist. It has been said that 65% of media reporters and editors use Facebook and LinkedIn for story research and 52% use Twitter ("Are Social Networking Sites Good for Our Society?," 2015).

The emergence of handheld devices such as smartphones and cheap broadcast quality video cameras, along with the internet and social media has created a whole new dimension to journalism. Anyone is able to report an event on the internet. This means that journalists have to concern themselves with proximity; both physical and temporal. Journalists are now putting

themselves in more dangerous situations. Not only do they have to get the news first, but they

must also get closer to the violent situations. For example, a journalist is not able to interview a

protagonist of a violent event or war from down the street (Hadland, 2015). The news market

was once able to enjoy the simplicity of having one platform for news. Now individual

journalists as well as news organizations have access to multiple outlets and must compete on

these multiple outlets with nonprofessional sources (Ashuri, 2012).

The job of the journalist has also changed with technology when it comes to getting it

right the first time. With print media, once a story was in the paper or in a magazine it is

permanent. When journalists need to meet a deadline they may not have the entire story or all the

evidence that goes with a story. However, if a story needs to get printed whatever the journalist

has must be used. It gets printed and the most that can be done at this point is write a new story

or add on to it the next day. In fact, it has been said that deadline pressures have had a negative

effect on the truthfulness of the news. With the internet, news providers who are online based

have what is considered a continuous deadline. They are able to take as much time as needed to

get all the facts, and even evidence they need to make sure they get the story right. However, if

they don't they can post a revised story whenever they do (Lăzăroiu, 2009).

Factors That Determine Technology in Media Newsrooms and How They Are Used

While doing research, I came across that one of the biggest changes in mainstream media

is what one can call a shift a heavier demand for quickness. Media and journalism have changed

and become entities that are focused on news of today and even tomorrow. With that being said

newspapers are labeled as entities of yesterday. They report yesterday's news. In Nikki Usher's

"Making the News at the New York Times" the terms aged news and real news are used to

describe the difference in the two. One thing that has remained constant though, is immediacy.

News was always to be delivered and quickly as possible; as quickly as the technology that was available during the time could allow (Usher, 2014). There were a few other factors that seem to remain constant determinants of what technologies media use in their newsrooms as well as how. These factors include how story ideas are obtained, fact checking, conducting research, and contacting sources.

To start, there are apps that have been made specifically for journalists. These apps are designed to save time and essentially make the work of journalists a little less difficult. For example, one of these apps for journalists has been compared to tinder. It was created to match journalists with pitches from public relation firms. In fact, it was designed so that any friction between a PR firm and freelancers would be removed so that they are able to work together on a story that an editor would pay the writer to write (Clover, 2015).

One major app that was not necessarily made for journalists but has been written about in relation to journalism is Twitter. This application's relevancy for the journalism profession has been increasing over the years. Twitter can be defined as a micro blogging application that has a distinct set of characteristic that allow it to function as a more prominent partner for news media than other social media sites (Soo Jung Moon & Hadley, 2014). Twitter has the ability to function as a broadcast medium due to instances where short messages also known as tweets have become breaking news feeds that affect mainstream media coverage. For example, in May of 2011, the the news that Osama Bin Laden had died had originally arrived from Twitter even before the president's official press conference. News organizations have even began using Twitter to find newsworthy information as well as publish their own news. Twitter has become an application that is an awareness system. Overall, mainstream media have embraced twitter as a new tool that can be used to their benefit (Soo Jung Moon & Hadley, 2014).

Twitter is the perfect example of how the previously mentioned factors have shaped and determined what new technologies are used in the newsroom. It is one of the new technologies that helps address each problem that mainstream media might have been facing. When considering urgency and being amongst the first to get the news out as quickly as possible can be seen when it comes on to certain strategies that can be used with Twitter. One strategy that can be used is live tweeting or live reporting. This means that while the events are occurring or unfolding, the report is happening at the same time. Essentially, tweeting everything that is happening while it is happening not only allows the media outlet to be one of the first to report, but it also keeps consumers engaged and tuned in (Matthew Clayfield, n.d.). Often times when a media outlet advertises that it will be live tweeting the event and it will create a hashtag so that people may tweet using the same hashtag, essentially creating one large conversation around the event. This real time reporting by journalists on twitter can be compared to a broadcast news live report. It is necessary and beneficial because of the 24-hour news cycle that now occurs. Live reporting has become essential across mediums including those that cover breaking news as well as those that cover events (Matthew Clayfield, n.d.).

Another way that journalists use new technologies like social media is crowdsourcing. News media outlets can now sift through trending topics to see what their audiences are talking about. After a study done on American Journalists, it was found that a significant amount used consumer produced information for story research. The study found that 89% said they used blogs, 65% used social media sites such as Facebook and LinkedIn and 52 % used Twitter. Social networks being good resources for information that journalists can use, has made the way they source stories very complex. Technology has helped to improved the processes of identifying stories that are newsworthy (Krotoski, 2011). The web has become the go-to point for

the globe when it comes to getting information; it's the same for reporters. Online, they find a

multiplicity of perspectives and a library of available knowledge that provides the context for

stories. Increasingly, the stories are coming from the web " (Krotoski, 2011).

Social networking services such as Facebook and Twitter can provide snapshots of events

happening globally from the viewpoint of first-hand witnesses (Krotoski, 2011). It gives

journalists a plethora of point of views on topics which can further help them make sure they get

all the sides of a story. They can then do more research on the topic and create a well-rounded

article that will draw the attention of their audiences.

Crowd sourcing's popularity has increased as a way for journalists to source contacts and

confirm reports as well as engage in discussions with the public (Matthew Clayfield, n.d.).

However, it is also a way to improve productivity and creativity while minimizing labor and

research expenses. Generally speaking, crowdsourcing invites the public to gather information,

examine documents or participate in other ways. The main goal or task is to allow non-specialists

to participate in the process of making a story. There are many different ways crowd sourcing

can be used. For example, the public can either help to gather information while things are

happening or afterwards. Sometimes the public is specifically asked to participate while at other

times they do so on their own free will. Crowdsourcing may also be determined by the type of

media or the type of story being written. Crowd sourcing allows journalists another resource for

information (Nils Mulvad, 2010).

Mainstream Media vs. Ethnic Media
Mainstream Media can be defined as the media that is produced by and produced for the

mainstream of society (Matsaganis, Katz, & Ball-Rokeach, 2011). It is distributed by the largest

distribution channels as well as provides news and information to a large amount of people at a

time. It is an entity that is becoming what the majority of media consumers are likely to

encounter. It is also employed that mainstream media is generally reflective of the prevailing

currents of thought, influence, or activity. It is often times associated with integrity and

reliability. Due to the fact that the mass media is geared to large audiences, the news reported is

typically centered on topics of general interest. Some media sources in fact will avoid reporting

on controversial topics because they will not want to lose members of the audience ("What is the

Mainstream Media?," n.d.).

Ethnic media tells the many stories of different ethnicities including African, African-

American, Asian, European, Indigenous, Latino, and Middle Eastern communities. These various

ethnic communities compromise much of American society. Ethnic Media is defined as media

produced for a particular community; it is produced by and for immigrants, racial ethnic and

linguistic minorities, and lastly indigenous populations living across different countries.

Although Ethnic media generally are aimed at the same goal and have the same general purpose,

they vary among different categories. These categories include; who produces the media, who

the target audience is, language used within the media, the size of the organization producing the

media, the location of the organization, how the organization is funded, what content the media

focuses on, and lastly how the content is distributed to its intended audience (Matsaganis et al.,

2011)

The definition of ethnic media given to us in Understanding Ethnic Media is one that is

broad enough to allow the inclusion of different ethnic media for each mentioned category. For

example, producers of ethnic media could be members of an ethnic community in a specific area

or big media organizations. To add, the audience or consumers of said media could be co-ethics

living in a neighborhood of a huge city or on the other hand include all people with the same

ethnic background living in different countries around the world. Ethnic media gives the minority communities a chance to see the news that is targeted more toward them. Their stories and programs are distributed in various forms. This includes ethnic newspapers, magazines, radio stations, television channels, cable networks, satellite network technology and the Internet (Matsaganis et al., 2011).

Importance of Ethnic Media

In 2005, a poll by the consulting/polling firm Bendixen & Associates, 13 percent of the adult population in the U.S "prefers" ethnic media over mainstream media, and one quarter of the U.S population regularly consume ethnic media (Altan, 2007). With these numbers increasing since then, and continuing to increase due to an increase in population, the importance of keeping ethnic media outlets well produced and accessible also increases.

Ethnic media as an industry is still growing. Like a child, it needs to be nourished and cared for to reach its full potential. The fact that it is still growing is another reason why it is an important industry. "Ethnic media is changing profoundly. Growing immigrant communities have made cities and neighborhoods across the country far more multi-ethnic and diverse" (Altan, 2007). Immigrant communities continue to spread throughout the United States. This means that ethnic media consumption is also likely to increase.

It is important to cover topics that are important to the minority communities in the United States. "…the challenge, going forward, is to step up our journalistic coverage of the struggles facing our communities -- immigration, civil rights, economic opportunity, cultural diversity -- which also happen to be some of the most fundamental and divisive issues facing the broader society" (Altan, 2007). These issues remain important and while mainstream media may

not cover it enough, ethnic media shows its importance here. It is needed to shed light on these issues until they are no longer issues.

Ethnic media outlets serve as an important resource for information for minority communities. "Ethnic media serve over 60 million adults living in the United States through roughly 3,000 print, online, radio, and television outlets…Residents who were not connected to the internet depend primarily on ethnic media newspapers, television, and radio- for finding health information and resources" (Vikki S. Katz et al., 2012). If these communities are increasing in size, it is important that we pay attention to ethnic media. Ethnic media is a sole source of information for a good amount of the population. Information must not only be accurate, but also continue to be readily available for these consumers. More importantly, ethnic media organizations and outlets must not fall behind when it comes to remaining up to date with technology. Future generations of ethnic media consumers will be more likely to want and be accustomed to using the newest technologies to receive news.

Challenges Ethnic Media Face

To begin, one issue that arises with ethnic media is first, finding resources. It is difficult for ethnic groups to be represented in mainstream media, but it is also difficult for ethnic groups to begin their own media outlets. Even so, once they do, big media companies buy them out. In turn, the once ethnic media that was used to help represent a community is now being used to make rich mainstream media companies richer. It has been said that mainstream groups are coopting minority successes through corporate takeovers. One prime example is NBC purchasing Telemundo, which is a channel geared towards Hispanic viewers (Mann & Morales, 2001). The issue with this is that NBC is now profiting off of something created by and for Hispanics, while

mainstream media that is produced by NBC does not have a large representation of Hispanics behind the scenes or in front of the camera.

Newspapers and magazines find there most important source of revenue to be advertising. In a market that is saturated, resources are limited and aren't necessarily available to support the funding of new media. Due to the fact that circulation leads to revenue, lack of resources could mean that the audience for ethnic media is not large enough. It could also mean that there are not enough businesses in the area generating an income that would allow them to spend money on advertising (Matsaganis et al., 2011). Other challenge that Ethnic media organizations face include changes in the socio economic environment that they operate in, challenges linked to history, demographics, and policy-context in which the communities they serve develop and lastly, emerging new communication technologies.

The internet is the future of communication. There has been a significant shift towards the increase of original news reporting by online newspapers. It is important for ethnic media organizations and outlets to work towards shifting with the rest of society in order to remain an influence on its intended audience (Dibean & Bruce Garrison, 2001).

Research Questions

Based on the literature review, there are a few questions I hope to answer upon further research. These questions are:

1. How are ethnic media organizations adapting to the changes in technologies used in media? If they aren't, what can they do to adapt to these changes?

2. What are ethnic media organizations doing to accommodate for the growing population of ethnic media consumers especially those that are a part of the younger generation?

3. What are ways that ethnic media organizations can make content available online

4. What benefits can ethnic media organizations see in developing a stronger presence online?

Methodology

I myself as a student at SUNY did not have access to certain resources that would allow me to gather information directly from ethnic media organizations. With that being said, I was fortunate enough to be able to look to research that was done by Professor Matthew Matsaganis as well as his graduate students. Once I had questions that I wanted to answer, I looked at the survey questions (included in the Appendix) and compared the two. I chose questions that would help me answer the questions that I had. Once I had a list of questions from the survey that was done, I looked at the responses to form conclusions based on the purpose of my thesis; to provide suggestions to ethnic media organizations on how to best use social media to their advantage.

Participants

Matsaganis and his graduate students conducted their research using ethnic media producers across the larger NYC area as participants. These ethnic media organizations and producers included were those who were serving immigrant communities across New York City. They were also included in the directory produced by the Center for Community and Ethnic Media that was most recent (Matsaganis, 2016).

Materials

There were multiple materials used for this experiment. Matsaganis and his graduate students used a series of emails, a consent form, surveys, as well as phone calls and in person interviews to conduct their research. The consent form included contact information for professor Matsaganis, the purpose of the study, benefits of the study, the potential risks and

discomforts and finally a section describing the confidentiality of the participants'' responses.

The survey included questions that centered around what the participants' organizations produce,

questions that centered on internet and social media use, the organizations audience

demographics, as well as the participants' role in the organization and what other roles are

present.

Procedure

The research began with emails. Invitations were sent out through email to as many

ethnic media organizations that are New York City based as possible. Most of these emails were

then followed up by phone calls to some individual producers by the CCEM's communications

Director as well as students from both the Department of Communication at University at

Albany, SUNY, and CUNY Graduate School of Journalism. The ethnic media producers were

then offered access to two workshops being offered by the CCEM as an incentive for taking part

in the survey. A total of 103 ethnic media organizations completed the survey by the end of the

study (Matsaganis, 2016).

Findings

I would like to first state that the findings that are included in this paper are from a study

entitled Broadband Internet Adoption & Ethnic Media Organizations in New York City done by

Matthew Matsaganis as well as students from both the CUNY Graduate School of Journalism

and the Department of Communication at University at Albany, SUNY. These findings are based

on the survey that was conducted on the ethnic media producers. The only findings that are

included are those that will be used to answer the original research questions. A copy of survey

questions that I thought were important in helping answer the research questions is located in the

Appendix.

From Section I. The Ethnic Media Organizations that Participated in the Study and Their Audiences

- **Organizational Demographics:** Just over 83% of participants indicating they produced a newspaper, magazine, or newsletter, 14% producing radio programming, 18% produced content for television and 41% reported that they produced content that was available on the Internet.

- **Audience Characteristics of NYC Ethnic Media Who Participated in the Study:** The totality of ethnic media organizations who participated in the survey reported that they were serving populations of those who were either born in or had the ability to trace their ancestry to over 30 different countries. The organizations that participated in the survey also indicated that there were efforts to appeal to a wide array of age groups ranging from the most common age group 30-49, followed by 50-64, 18-29, to the least common age group of 65 or older.

From Section II. Ethnic Media Producers' Perceptions of Their Competition and Their Audience

- The survey found that the majority of ethnic media producers felt as though their audiences were sensitive to both changes made in content as well as price increases. Out of all the participants 50% said they agreed or strongly agreed that their audiences were sensitive to changes made in content while 53% agreed or strongly agrees that audience members were sensitive to price increases.

- About one third 29% to be exact, of the producers reported that their competition was trying to lower their prices, 36% said they were trying to promote new content, and 33 % said that competition was trying to adopt technology that would help them engage

audiences. Additionally, 24% agreed or strongly agreed that competitors were investing in technology to produce new content as well.

From Section IV. Organizational Goals & the Internet

- **What Organizational Goals Ethnic Media Consider Most Important:** In order of most important to least important, ethic media organizations reported that they were mostly concerned about; 1. distributing content to their main audience, 2. Reaching out to new audiences, 3. Making sure audiences knew how to contact their organizations, 4. Making it easier for members of their organizations to work together, 5. Getting feedback from audience members on stories they had produced, and 6. competing against other media that targeted the same audiences they do.

- **What Organizational Goals Ethnic Media Believe the Internet Can Help Them with the Most:** Producers were asked about how helpful the internet is or could be for accomplishing a variety of organizational goals in which they reported the internet could be most helpful for; 1. Reaching out to new audiences, 2. Distributing content to their main audiences, 3.making sure audience members know how to get in touch with the media organization, 4.getting feedback from audience members about stories produced, 5. Getting suggestions for stories by the audience, and 6. Competing against other media that targeted the same audiences as they do.

- **What Organizational Goals Ethnic Media Believe Social Media Can Help Them with the Most:** The organizational goal that producers said the internet could help them achieve that came in on top was reaching out to new audiences or expanding their audience base. When the same question was asked about social media, the goal that producers had mentioned more often than others was building their organization's brand,

followed by learning about their audience, interacting with their audience, and attracting

potential advertisers respectively.

From Section V. Presence on the Web and Social Media, Use of Computers and Smartphones

- Nine out of 10 or 90% of the ethnic media producers that participated said that they had a

  website and 7% reported that they had one in the past. When asked about social media,

  82% of the organizations reported having an account on social networking sites, 5% said

  they do not have an account currently but had one in the past, and 11% reported never

  having a social media account.

- Additionally, approximately one in three organizations or 29% said that they had an app

  at the time of the survey 7% reported having one in the past and 57% said they never had

  one.

From Section VII. Ethnic Media's Use of Social Media

- The ethnic media organizations that participated reported on average having accounts on

  three different social media. The most popular of these were Facebook at 69%, Twitter at

  52%, YouTube at 34%, Google+ at 23%, LinkedIn at 21%, and Instagram at 10%. One

  third or 33 % of participants who reported that they had social media account reported

  that they posted something on social media several times a week while 46% said that they

  posted on social media about once a day or several times a week.

- To add, 46% of ethnic media producers said that they agreed or strongly agreed that the

  opinions and comments that audience members shared with them on their organization's

  website or via social media impacted what stories they did or did not cover.

From Section VIII. Ethnic Media's Website

- **Website Use:** At the time or in the past, ethnic media producers whose organization had websites reported that their organizations used the website mainly to do the following: 1. Seventy-two percent (72%) said to post stories as text, 69% to post photos, 45% to post videos, 2. Forty-one percent (41) % said for the audience to find information necessary to communicate with members if the organization such as an e-mail address, and 3.Thirty-nine percent (39%) said for audience members to offer feedback on content by posting public comments. Very few producers reported the use of websites to stream content, host blogs, archive and disseminate podcast, and facilitate audience members setting up RSS feeds by their organization.

- **Smartphone- and Tablet-Specific Version of Website:** Half of those surveyed that had websites reported that they produced a specific version for users who accessed their site from a smartphone or tablet while 8% reported that they did not know whether or not they produced a smartphone- or tablet-friendly version. Two thirds or 69% of the producers working for ethnic media with a website said their site was somewhat (46%) or very user friendly (23%). The remainder reported that their site was not user friendly at all when accessed via smartphone or tablet (10%), and 22% said they did not know.

- **Website Management:** A quarter of the ethnic media said they have full-time staff that are designated to manage the organization's website, another quarter has part-time staff that does it, and one in five organizations rely on volunteers. The last 24% reported that they had no one who managed the website.

From Section IX. Ethnic Apps

- About one in three ethnic media had an app for their audience members to use at the time that the survey was conducted and 7% reported having one in the past. Those producers

working for media that have developed apps for their audience members said that the apps were most helpful for: 1. Building up the organization's brand, then 2. Attracting potential advertisers, 3. Reaching out to new audiences, and 4. Getting suggestions for stories from audience members.

From Section X. Online Metrics

- Forty-eight percent (48%) of ethnic media organizations with a website reported that they had no more than 20,000 unique visitors on their website every month and 16% said that they did not know how many visitors they had per month. Forty-four percent (44%) said that they had no more than 20,000 page views per month and 1 in 5 producers said they did not know how many page views they had received.

From Section XI. Technology Adoption: Ahead or Behind the Curve

- With respect to accepting and using new communication technologies, ethnic producers rated their organizations well. Thirty-five percent (35%) indicated that their organization was fairly good, another 30% rated their organization as very good and another 27% rated their organizations as quite good. There was only 6% who rated their organizations as not good at all.

- When it came to how much they used new communication and information technologies compared to other ethnic media that served the same audience, About a quarter (26%)of the ethnic media organizations that participated said they thought their organization was ahead of the curve. More than half (58%) said that their organization was doing about average in terms of using social media, while the remaining 11% said they felt their organization was behind the curve. When asked to compare their organizations against mainstream media the numbers reported were less favorable or the ethnic media organizations. A larger 44% reported that they were behind the curve while 37% reported that they were about average, and only 9% indicated they were ahead of the curve

From Section XII. Barriers to Using the Web and Social Media
- Those ethnic media that reported not having a website most commonly

  reported that the reason was due to concerns that there was a lack in available

  staff to maintain a website as well as not having the financial resources to

  build and maintain a website. The previously mentioned reasons were also

  reported to be the reason why ethnic media producers did not have a presence

  on social media along with the lack of skills necessary to use social media

  among their staff.

Discussion

Based on some of the findings from the original survey done (Matsaganis, 2016), I was able

to answer the original questions that were derived from the literature review. Firstly, I would like

to address the first question which focusses on how ethnic media organizations are adapting to

the changes in technologies used in media, as well as suggestions on how they can adapt to these

changes if they are not already doing so. Based on the research findings, I would say that ethnic

media organizations have been making a good attempt to keep up with the changes in

technology. According to the results, 41% reported that they produced content that was made

available on the internet. Although this number isn't high, it shows that the organizations that

have participated are at least making an effort. With the Internet being one of the most important

changes in technology pertaining to mainstream media, it is important that ethnic media have

content on the internet.

The results from the survey also reported that 90% of ethnic media producers said they had a

website while 82% of the organizations reported having an account on social networking sites

and 29% said they had an app. Not only does this show how they are adapting to the changes in

technology by making sure they are participating in and using these new technologies but this also shows how they are accommodating for the growing population of ethnic media consumers as well as those that are part of the younger generation; the second research question. With the population growing, it would be costlier for ethnic media to print stories as opposed to having their content available on the internet.

It was reported that the most common age group that the organizations who participated in the survey were making efforts to appeal was 30-49, then 50-64, and 18-29. Interestingly enough, the 18-29 age group is the younger population that contains people that are the heavier internet and social media users. If the ethnic media organizations switch and begin to also focus on this younger age group, they will be able to retain the audience members of these ages until they reach the 30-49, and even up until they reach the 50-64 age group. Focusing on this younger population can add longevity to the relationships that these organizations are creating. And in order to do so, ethnic media organizations must appeal to the younger generation. This comes with making content that can appeal to both audiences. However, they must also be careful to not lose their main audiences by trying to reach new audiences. This can be done by creating specific content that is geared to the younger generations which leads to the next research question.

Making more content available online can be extremely helpful in reaching new audiences. Ethnic media organizations can continue to make content available online by making sure content is accessible through smartphones, and tablets, as well as increasing the use of apps. The survey indicated that 50% of those surveyed produced a version of their website that was specific for users who accessed it from a smartphone or tablet. Additionally, 46% said that this version was somewhat user friendly and another 23% said it was very user friendly. Having content that

is easy accessible is important to appealing to the younger population. This portion of the population has essentially grown up on content being easily accessible.

They can also make content available online by hosting competitions and giveaways. Having contests via social media and giveaways on websites will increase the amount of traffic and followers on websites and social networks. In fact, 48% of ethnic media organizations with a website reported that they had no more than 20,000 unique visitors on their website every month. Having content like competitions and giveaways attracts those who would not necessarily come to the website, thus increasing unique visitors, and potentially increasing return visitors as well.

Increasing the use of social networking sites like Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram will help ethnic media organizations reach new audiences, as well as help build a brand. These things will also lead to increased exposure. The survey indicated that the most popular accounts that ethnic media organizations had were Facebook (69%), Twitter (52%), YouTube (34%), Google+ (23%), LinkedIn (21%), and Instagram (10%). If these social networking sites are all being used to their full potential, ethnic media organizations will be able to continue to be successful in keeping connected and interacting with their audiences and potential audiences.

The last research question that will be addressed involves the benefits that ethnic media organizations can see in developing a stronger presence online. According to the results, ethnic media organizations reported that the two things they were mostly concerned about were distributing content to their main audience as well as reaching out to new audiences. They also reported that the internet is or could be most helpful in reaching out to new audiences as well as distributing content to their main audiences. With that being said, one of the benefits that ethnic media can see in developing a stronger presence online is not only increasing their audience but making sure their current audiences are satisfied and stick around.

Having a growing audience in turn opens up new doors for the ethnic media organization. In fact, one of the more important effects of having a large and growing audience is the potential revenue that will start to come in. Advertisers like to use organizations, websites, and outlets, that have large audiences to advertise Once advertisers see that a particular ethnic media organization has a large audience, they will be more likely to want to advertise through said organization as well as pay to advertise through said organization.

An increase in revenue also leads to more opportunities for ethnic media organizations. For example, one issue that was reported in the survey was lack of staff due to lack of financial resources. It was reported that only a quarter of the ethnic media organizations had full-time staff that are designated to manage the organization's website while another quarter ad part-time staff that manage the websites. Being that this is such an important part of keeping up with changing times, having full-time staff that run websites as well as social media can be extremely beneficial to ethnic media organizations. Having full-time staff to manage websites and social media accounts means that there is always content being made available for audiences. It also ensures that interactions with audiences are consistent, which also leads to audience retention.

The survey indicated that ethnic media organizations don't believe they are doing ass well as mainstream media organizations. When asked to compare themselves to mainstream media, 44% of ethnic media organizations reported they were behind the curve, 37% reported they were average, and 9% reported they were ahead of the curve. When asked to compare against other ethnic media organizations, 11% reported that they were behind the curve, 58% reported they were average, and 26% reported being ahead of the curve. With the previous suggestions, these numbers may even out a bit more. In the future, with the right strategies as

well as previously mentioned suggestions, ethnic media organizations can find themselves

competing better with mainstream media.

Works Cited

Akin, J. (2005, March). Mass Media. Retrieved from

http://www.beyondintractability.org/essay/mass-communication

Altan, D. (2007, February 27). Ethnic Media in the U.S.: A Growing Force. Retrieved from

http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/newswar/part3/ethnic.html

Are Social Networking Sites Good for Our Society? (2015). Retrieved from

http://socialnetworking.procon.org/#Background

Ashuri, T. (2012). Activist Journalism: Using Digital Technologies and Undermining Structures.

Communication, Culture & Critique, *5*(1), 38–56. Retrieved from

http://libproxy.albany.edu/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&

db=cax&AN=71515247&site=ehost-live

Capitol Hill's Telephonic Revolution. (n.d.). Retrieved from

http://history.house.gov/Exhibitions-and-Publications/Electronic-Technology/Telephone/

Carlson, N. (2009, January 30). Printing The NYT Costs Twice as Much as Sending Every

Subscriber a Free Kindle. Retrieved from

http://www.businessinsider.com/2009/1/printing-the-nyt-costs-twice-as-much-as-

sending-every-subscriber-a-free-kindle

Clover, J. (2015). Pop & Circumstance. *Nation*, *301*(20), 37–37. Retrieved from

http://libproxy.albany.edu/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&

db=a9h&AN=110600878&site=ehost-live

Dibean, W., & Bruce Garrison. (2001). How Six Online Newspapers Use Web Technologies.

Newspaper Research Journal, *22*(2). Retrieved from

https://www.questia.com/library/journal/1G1-79573839/how-six-online-newspapers-use-

web-technologies

Garrison, B. (2001). Diffusion of Online Information Technologies in Newspaper Newsrooms. *Journalism*, *2*(2), 221–239. http://doi.org/10.1177/146488490100200206

Hadland, A. (2015). Risk and Journalism in the Digital Age. *African Journalism Studies*, *36*(1), 129–134. http://doi.org/10.1080/23743670.2015.1008179

Heikkilä, H., & Ahva, L. (2015). The Relevance of Journalism. *Journalism Practice*, *9*(1), 50–64. http://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2014.928465

Kelly Ngyah. (n.d.). Modern Technology and Conflicts. Retrieved from https://books.google.com/books?id=QadZCAAAQBAJ&pg=PT11&lpg=PT11&dq=the+study+development+and+application+of+devices,+machines,+and+techniques+of+manufacturing&source=bl&ots=39s7cTFo8W&sig=1mnJGL14cALF66gDS3bKrPgUSGE&hl=en&sa=X&ved=0ahUKEwj2-Iff6cPMAhUJjz4KHXBBCgUQ6AEIITAB#v=onepage&q&f=false

Krotoski, A. (2011, February 19). What Effect Has the Internet Had on Journalism? Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2011/feb/20/what-effect-internet-on-journalism

Lăzăroiu, G. (2009). The Internet as a Journalistic Medium. *Contemporary Readings in Law & Social Justice*, *1*(2), 116–120. Retrieved from http://libproxy.albany.edu/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=48079763&site=ehost-live

Lewis, T. (2014). Tweeting @ Work: The Use of Social Media in Professional Communication. *Information Services & Use*, *34*(1/2), 89–90. Retrieved from http://libproxy.albany.edu/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=98284238&site=ehost-live

Mann, J., & Morales, M. (2001, October 12). NBC Buy Telemundo in $2.7 Billion Deal.

Retrieved from http://articles.sun-sentinel.com/2001-10-

12/news/0110120258_1_telemundo-debt-hialeah-based-telemundo-communications-

hispanic

Mary Bellis. (2015, October 21). The Invention of Radio. Retrieved from

http://inventors.about.com/od/rstartinventions/a/radio.htm

Matsaganis, M. D. (2016, January 21). Broadband Internet Adoption & Ethnic Media

Organizations in New York City.

Matsaganis, M. D., Katz, V. S., & Ball-Rokeach, S. J. (2011). *Understanding Ethnic Media

Producers, Consumers, and Societies*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.

Matthew Clayfield. (n.d.). Tweet the Press: How Social Media is Changing the Way Journalists

do Their Jobs. *Metro Magazine*, (171).

Miguel F. Aznar. (2005). *Technology Challenged Understanding Our Creations and Choosing

Our Future*. Knowledge Context.

Nils Mulvad. (2010, October 13). Crowdsourcing in Investigative Journalism. Retrieved from

http://gijn.org/2011/04/04/crowdsourcing-in-investigative-journalism/

Soo Jung Moon, & Hadley, P. (2014). Routinizing a New Technology in the Newsroom: Twitter

as a News Source in Mainstream Media. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*,

58(2), 289–305. Retrieved from

http://libproxy.albany.edu/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&

db=a9h&AN=96587270&site=ehost-live

The Greatest Change in the History of Media. (2013).

The Personal News Cycle: How Americans Choose to Get Their News. (2014, March 17).

Retrieved from https://www.americanpressinstitute.org/publications/reports/survey-

research/personal-news-cycle/

The State of the News Media 2013. (2013). Retrieved from

http://www.stateofthemedia.org/2013/overview-5/

Usher, N. (2014). *Making News at the New York Times*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan

Press.

Vikki S. Katz, Matthew D. Matsaganis, & Sandra J. Ball-Rokeach. (2012). Ethnic Media as

Partners for Increasing Broadband Adoption and Social Inclusion. *Journal of Information

Policy*, *2*, 79–102. http://doi.org/10.5325/jinfopoli.2.2012.0079

"What Hath God Wrought" The House and the Telegraph. (n.d.). Retrieved from

http://history.house.gov/Exhibitions-and-Publications/Electronic-Technology/Telegraph/

What is the Mainstream Media? (n.d.). Retrieved from http://www.wisegeek.com/what-is-the-

mainstream-media.htm

Appendix

SURVEY QUESTIONS THAT WERE USED TO HELP ANSWER RESEARCH QUESTIONS

(*The numbers in parentheses represent the research questions that correspond to each survey question. The lettered point underneath each question represents what the responses to that question could potentially tell us.*)

1. Does your organization currently have a website OR did it have a website in the past? (1,2)

    a. Shows if ethnic media organizations are keeping up with technology as well as accommodating for younger generations

2. Does your organization currently have an application or app to deliver information, stories, or services to audience members that use smartphones and/or tablets? (1,2)

    a. Shows if ethnic media organizations are keeping up with technology as well as accommodating for younger generations

    b. Also shows if ethnic media organizations are accessible on the go

3. Does your organization currently have an account on any social networking sites (or social media) (For example: Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, or any other similar site?) (1,2)

    a. Shows if ethnic media organizations are keeping up with technology as well as accommodating for younger generations

    b. Also shows if ethnic media organizations are accessible on the go

4. How would you describe your job at the organization? If you do multiple things, please select as many options as apply to you. If none of the options describe what you do very well please explain what you do in the box provided under the last option (1,2,3)

    a. Shows if ethnic media organizations are keeping up with technology as well as accommodating for younger generations

    b. Also shows if ethnic media organizations are accessible on the go

    c. Shows if there are people that are being paid to run social media

5. How many people working for the organization would you say use a computer in order to do their job? (1,2,3)

    a. Shows if ethnic media organizations are keeping up with technology as well as accommodating for younger generations

    b. Also shows if ethnic media organizations are accessible on the go

    c.   Shows if there are people that are being paid to run social media or websites or anything internet related

6. How many people working for the organization would you say use a cell phone or smartphone for work related tasks? (1,2)

    a.   Shows if there are people being paid to keep up with apps or potential people that can be used to keep up with apps

7. How many people working for the organization would you say use the internet for work related tasks? (1,2)

    a.   Shows if there is anyone responsible for internet related activity

8. How many people working for the organization would you say use social media (like Twitter, Facebook, or other similar sites and services) in order to do their job? (1,2,3)

    a.   Shows if there are people that are paid specifically for maintenance of social media or already know how to use social media to help the ethnic media organization

9. Generally speaking, how good would you say that your organization is when it comes to accepting and using new information and communication technologies? (1,2)

    a.   Shows how willing organization is to have new technologies as well as new ways to use the internet to reach their audiences

10. How does your organization compare to together ethnic media that serve the same audiences or communities that you do in terms of how much they use new communication and information technologies, like the internet and social media? Would you say that your organization is…? (1,2)

    a.   Shows if company is already using social media as part of their organizations day to day activity as well as how well they are doing compared to others organizations

11. How does your organization compare to mainstream media in terms of how much they use new communication and information technologies, like the internet and social media? Would you say that your organization is… (1,2)?

    a.   Shows if company is already using social media as part of their organizations day to day activity as well as how well they are doing compared to others organizations

12. When your organization gets new technological devices such as new computers for example, how often does it need someone from outside the organization to set them up and show people how to use them? (1,2,3)

     a.   Shows if people working at the organization are well equipped for change in technology

13. How important are the following goals for your organization? (1,2,3,4)

-shows what accommodations are being made for growing population and organizations ability to adapt to technological advances

     a.   Making sure audience members know how to get in touch with your organization

     b.   Getting feedback from audience members about stories that you have produced

     c.   Reaching out to new audiences (or expanding your audience base)

14. How helpful does your organization believe that the Internet is (or could be) fir achieving the following goals? Please list up to five ethnic media that you would say have the strongest presence on social media sites, like Facebook, Twitter and others. (4)

     a.   Can be used to give advice and suggestions to organizations that don't use the internet as to what some benefits are

15. Which of the following are things that your organization does with its website? Please select all that apply. (4)

     a.   Shows what organization is doing to increase online presence and what benefits may occur as a result of that.

16. Does your organization have a version of its website that is made specifically for people who access it from a smartphone, a tablet, or some other mobile device? (1,2,3)

     a.   Shows if organization is making content accessible on the go an appealing to younger generation

17. When you access your organization's website from a smartphone, tablet, or some other mobile device, how user-friendly would you say that it is? (1,2,3)

     a.   Accessibility and ability to keep up with new technologies, accommodation

18. Please tell us how helpful you think apps are for achieving the following organizational goals. (4)

     a.   Suggestions for organizations that don't have these things implemented.

19. On which of the following social media does your organization have an account and presence? Select all those that apply to your organization and please add any social media that your organization has but is not listed here (1,2,3)

     a.   Accessibility and technological advancement suggestions for other organizations

20. How much attention does your organization pay to the following metrics or measures of online media activity? (4)

    a. Shows how important certain online activity is, good for suggestions to organizations that don't use them

21. How do you manage your websites content? (4)

    a. Suggestions to other organizations on maintenance

22. How often does someone from your organization post something on social media sites using your organizations account or profile? (1,2)

    a. Shows if there are people who work with social media at the organization.

23. How important are social media for achieving the following goals? (4)

    a. Shows importance of social media, suggestions for other organizations that don't use social media

24. To how many of the comments people post on social media about your organization or about stories you have produced do you reply? (4)

    a. Shows how involved organization is with audience.

25. How do you manage your organizations social media accounts or profiles? (4)

    a. Shows maintenance of relationship and presence with audience, good for suggestions

26. How much would you agree or disagree that the following or reasons why your organization does not currently have a website? (3)

    a. Help with giving suggestions of how organizations can have online presence

27. Do you think your organization will have a website in the future? (4)

    a. Shows maintenance of presence, or need/ want for growth into an organization that uses internet as well as shows what organizations plan on continuing using internet due to its benefits

28. How much would you agree or disagree that the following are reasons why your organization does not use social media? (3,4)

    a. Help with giving suggestions of how organizations can have online presence

29. Do you think that your organization will create an account or profile on and social media in the future? (3,4)

a. Shows need/want to grow into an organization with social media presence

30. If your organization was to create a profile or account on social media in the near future which two social media would you be most likely to start using? (3,4)

   a. Good for making suggestions to organizations

31. How often is your newspaper or magazine published? (3,4)

   a. Shows accessibility and organizations concern with getting media out to the public.

32. Tell us how much you agree with the following statements that are about how likely you think it is that you will use social media for work related tasks in the future. (3,4)

   a. Shows benefits of using social media as well as how much content would be available to audience based on the organization

33. What percentage of people you work with use social media for work related tasks? (3,4)

   a. Shows if employees in organizations are already using social media to deliver content to audience

34. What percentage of your friends use social media? (3,4)

   a. Shows the role social media plays in the lives of others