

University at Albany, State University of New York

Scholars Archive

Emergency Preparedness, Homeland Security,
and Cybersecurity

Honors College

Spring 5-2020

The Chocolate Industry: Blood, Sweat, and Tears is What Makes Chocolate Sweet

Gabriella Bartley

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarsarchive.library.albany.edu/honorscollege_ehc



Part of the [Social History Commons](#)

The Chocolate Industry: Blood, Sweat, and Tears is What Makes Chocolate Sweet

An honors thesis presented to the
College of Emergency Preparedness, Homeland Security, and Cybersecurity,
University at Albany, State University of New York
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for graduation with Honors in Homeland Security
and
graduation from The Honors College

Gabriella Bartley

Research Advisor: Dennis McCarty, Ph.D.

May 2020

Abstract

Forced labor is a form of human trafficking that affects hundreds of thousands of people worldwide. Products that we enjoy, such as chocolate, are part of industries that are built on the exploitation of people. Forced labor allows traffickers to take advantage of people by not supplying a proper wage or needs for survival. The chocolate industry has had a history of causing economic hardships for those in the supply chain. Farm owners are responsible for costly supplies needed to operate a cocoa farm before farming begins only to gain small profits. Companies leading the chocolate industry do not want to change their ways because their profit margins would be diminished, and the leaders would not receive their pay bonuses. Chocolate is a product that requires tremendous amounts of labor with the cultivation and processing of the cocoa beans before they move up the supply chain. Thus, they pay the minimum to farmers for the hard-earned beans that the laborers harvest. Survivors of forced labor do not leave unscathed, and many endure both psychological and physical effects. Children are forced to work on cocoa farms completing tasks such as climbing cocoa trees with sharp objects to reach the pods, which can leave lasting impacts on their health if a fall takes place. Although some initiatives have been developed to help forced laborers, many of the systems do not address their specific needs or provide them with an opportunity to participate. Governments and chocolate company leaders must work together to address the issues facing the supply chains and trace where the cocoa beans originate to ensure forced labor was not used. Organizations such as Fair Trade USA are supposed to help farmers with the costs of cocoa production, so they do not resort to labor trafficking. More progressive, forceful action is necessary if changes toward the cocoa industry regarding forced labor is to happen soon.

Acknowledgments

There are many people that I would like to thank for helping me through the process of writing my thesis. I will begin by thanking my family and friends for supporting me throughout my academic career. They have stood by my side throughout this journey and many others. From the times where I have struggled to stay up late to complete assignments to the countless smiles, I have shared with them while doing so, thank you. These are memories that have helped make my academic successes possible.

I would also like to thank the faculty and staff of the College of Emergency Preparedness, Homeland Security, and Cybersecurity. The College has provided a variety of unique opportunities that have helped me grow my skill set. I have met people from a variety of career backgrounds, and I have learned about topics that developed my professional interests. Figuring out the logistics of this thesis would not have been possible without the College. The faculty and staff want to see their students grow and succeed, and I thank all involved in making my experience within this major memorable.

My interest in learning about human trafficking stemmed from Dr. Dennis McCarty when I took his course on human trafficking as a college freshman. Little did I know, I would write a thesis on that topic two years later or be president of an anti-trafficking club on campus. I would not have been able to complete this project without the support of Dr. Dennis McCarty. He has been there since the start of this project and has spent countless hours reading and exchanging emails. Without his patience around my demanding schedule and quick responses to emails, this thesis would not be what it is today.

Table of Contents

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgments	iii
Introduction	1
A. What is Human Trafficking?	1
B. History and Economics of Chocolate Companies	8
How Chocolate is Made	13
A. History of Cocoa	13
B. Forced Labor in the Cocoa Industry	16
What is a Laborer in the Cocoa Industry Asked to Do?	19
A. Age Range and Demographics.....	19
B. Tools Used	21
C. Tasks Performed and Environmental Impact.....	23
D. Living and Working as a Cocoa Farmer	25
Survivors of Forced Labor	28
A. How Do People Get Involved With Force Labor?.....	28
B. Psychological Effects	32
C. Physical Effects.....	35
Conclusion	39
A. Victim Help.....	39
B. What Can Consumers Do?.....	42
C. How Truthful is Fair Trade?	45
References	49

Introduction/Background

What is Human Trafficking?

As history has evolved, many human rights violations have been addressed; however, human trafficking is a violation that has fallen through the cracks until more recently. It was not until the year 2000 for there to be an internationally recognized definition for the term “human trafficking.”

Trafficking in persons shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.

- United Nations Human Rights, 2000, Article 3, paragraph a.

A definition of this issue was formed after it was brought to the United Nations. This definition is still in practice today; however, it did not advance to acceptance without barriers. At the United Nations meeting, where the United States presented the Palermo Protocol, not all countries agreed to sign it at first. Many countries had reservations, and it took time for the majority of nations to sign. For example, Article 15 (which is on the settlement of disputes) posed a reservation for multiple countries, including Myanmar, Malaysia, Saudi Arabia, and Thailand. To date, not all nations have signed the protocol; however, there are 117 signatories and 176 parties that have agreed to follow it (United Nations Treaty Collection, 2003).

Based on the definition that the United Nations created for human trafficking, this human rights violation has been taking place for centuries throughout the world. Statistics on human trafficking are not always accurate because researchers do not know how many cases are present or have taken place. Despite this, there are organizations designed to collect data and make it publically available. For example, since the start of the Polaris Project in 2007 until 2018, their hotline has identified over 23,000 survivors, nearly 11,000 human trafficking cases, and almost 6,000 potential traffickers.¹ This organization collected demographics on the survivors and found that approximately 5,000 survivors were minors, over 7,000 were of unknown ages, and the majority were females (Polaris, 2020).

Sometimes the phrase “Human trafficking is modern-day slavery” is used to give a quick synopsis on the term. Many people understand what slavery means, but not necessarily what human trafficking comprises. The term “human trafficking” has multiple components that can be addressed individually. The reason for a complex definition is to ensure that different activities are incorporated in terms of the law.

Three main elements contribute to what trafficking is and the definition that the United Nations uses: the act, the means, and the purpose (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, n.d.). The act refers to what is done or the actions that are taking place. Actions include either recruitment or the receipt of persons. The means is how the process took place. The process includes a threat or use of force, abuse of power (especially if the person is vulnerable), or if the person is required to provide a form of payment or benefit to the trafficker. Finally, the purpose is the reasoning behind why the action was completed. Some examples of the purpose are for

¹ Note: Throughout this document, the terms victim and survivor will be used. As a distinction, the term “victim” will refer to an individual still involved in trafficking. The term “survivor” will refer to an individual who is out of the trafficking cycle. A survivor is learning how to handle life without their trafficker.

exploitation, forced labor, or removal of organs. If those three elements are found in a circumstance, the prosecution can begin for the trafficking of a person, and future criminalization should follow.

Human trafficking affects almost every nation, including the United States. It does not discriminate from age, race, gender, or nationality (United States Department of Homeland Security, 2019). Countries can be involved or associated through either the production of goods or services or the origins of the impacted families. Identifying human trafficking can be unclear as there are a variety of ways that a trafficker can manipulate their victim. Most victims are not living on their own. The majority have lives and families that they are trying to support, particularly with labor trafficking. The victims may not realize what they endured until they are out of the situation and have time to reflect. It may take time for a survivor to understand the harm they were experiencing because the trafficker may be giving them something that the survivor was missing in their life, or if the individual needed the trafficker for income. Leaving a situation that one has grown to adapt is a frightening thought, especially when it is related to basic needs to survive.

The number of victims from this crime has only increased over the years due to a majority of factors. Despite this, the type of individual who can make an “ideal” victim has not changed. Some individuals are more susceptible to being manipulated. Mainly if they are: “Psychologically or emotionally vulnerable, in economic hardship, lack a social safety net, endure a recent natural disaster (this could relate and cause other factors on this list), or experience political instability (where the government does not have the means to control this crime)” (United States Department of Homeland Security, 2019). When one is experiencing one

of the prior factors, it is challenging to overcome obstacles they may face, which can cause them to become involved in what appears to be a cycle of manipulation.

Once a trafficker can identify what the vulnerability is with that person, they can use that weakness to their advantage by offering the victim ways to help that burden. For example, if the trafficker sees an individual struggling to provide for their family (financial hardship), they may offer to take one of their children, so that there is one less mouth to feed and person to look after. The trafficker would tell the family that they will take care of the child by bringing them to a place with other children and where they may offer things. Other things could be objects or experiences that the parents would be unable to. From the parent perspective, they will be losing one of their own; however, the trafficker will be lessening their burden or giving them money for their child. The trafficker may bring the child to a plantation with other children where they are required to work in the fields without receiving any pay and given the minimum necessities for survival. The child would not know how to leave, because they are young and taught to listen to their superiors, which is how a victim can become trapped in a cycle of manipulation, fear, and ignorance to the crime where they are an innocent sufferer.

Labor Trafficking/Forced Labor

The type of trafficking (whether it is sex trafficking, organ trafficking, forced labor, or debt bondage) can vary in popularity based on region. For example, in countries that are closer to the equator, more crops can be grown; thus, workers are needed to harvest the crops. In these locations, there may be more forced labor than sex trafficking cases because of demand. Forced labor is not limited to one industry and affects all ages and genders. More vulnerable people have a higher chance of becoming involved in a forced labor situation. There are different industries where the demand for a specific race or gender may be more desired. This desirability could be

due to the person's size or capabilities. Forced labor has a similar definition to slavery; thus, its roots started early in history with changes taking place before it was recognized under the definition of human trafficking. In 1930, the International Labour Organization (ILO) had a convention to establish a universal definition of forced labor;

Forced or compulsory labour is all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered himself voluntarily.

- C029 - Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29), (n.d.), article 1.

This definition can be separated into different components for a better understanding. The first part is work or service, which addresses the types of work that occur in an industry or sector. The second element is the menace of any penalty. This component refers to the disciplinary action that a worker can experience. A worker should not be threatened with punishment if the task assigned was not completed properly due to incorrect instructions or from a situation out of their control. The third component of the definition is how the worker is completing activities voluntarily. A worker should offer their capabilities based on informed consent, and the worker can take or leave a job at any time (International Labour Organization, n.d.). This definition allows a worker to be informed and understand the requirements for a job before applying. Additionally, it enables a worker to decide whether they wish to pursue the position further or decline before accepting.

It is also important to note that the definition of forced labor does not cover all circumstances. There are some exceptions to allow for other occurrences that may not be within the norm. The exceptions include compulsory military service, normal civic obligations, prison

labor (under certain conditions), work in emergencies, and minor communal services (C029 - Forced Labour Convention, 1930 [No. 29], n.d.). Even though there are certain situations where the ILO is more lenient on what is allowed with labor laws, there are some indicators that can distinguish where actions lean towards forced labor. Indicators include the withholding of a worker's identification documents or wages, a threat or act of either physical or sexual abuse, or risks that prevent a worker from leaving their job. If any of those indicators are present, actions are present that violate regulatory laws (International Labour Organization, n.d.). The ILO has fostered changes within various labor industries, and there have been strives made to fight this crime. However, modern-day slavery is still a problem in many countries. Especially where the demand for work is high, and families face situations that make them vulnerable.

Child Trafficking and Labor

The ILO defines a child as anyone under the age of 17 (Bureau of International Labor Affairs, n.d.-a). Governments across the world have combined efforts to reduce the number of children that are employed. Since the year 2000, nearly 94 million children were removed from child labor (Bureau of International Labor Affairs, n.d.-a). Various laws have been established both internationally and by federal governments to address this problem. As time has passed, employers have found ways around the laws and policies in place to cause the need for further action.

In 1973, the ILO established a minimum age (14 years) for employment or work that is outside of education. The ILO also stated there is a minimum age for any work that could risk the health, safety, or morals of an individual (18 years); however, there are specifications and laws established by each nation for those between the ages of 13 and 15 (C029 - Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29), n.d.). For example, the employer of a child working in a household

must ensure the child is still being educated and not overworked or exposed to harsh substances. Previous resolutions had a goal to eliminate child labor. One of the necessary components in those resolutions was sustained economic growth, which would aid in the alleviation of poverty and increase education (C182 - Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999, n.d.). The ILO held a convention in 1999 that focused on what the worst forms of child labor are. Those at the convention stated the worst forms of child labor are: all forms of slavery or practices that are similar to slavery, the use of children in prostitution settings, the use of children to conduct illicit activities (such as the movement of drugs or other banned substances), and any work that could cause harm to the health or safety of the child (C182 - Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999, n.d.).

Children are anatomically smaller than adults; thus, they can complete tasks that adults are unable to execute due to their size. Tasks can vary from being able to crawl into a tight space, such as a mineshaft, fit between large, powerful machines to fix them as they continue to run or operate cumbersome machinery. More specifically, in Nepal, the worst forms of child labor include embellishing textiles, weaving carpets, and producing bricks (United States Department of Labor, 2018). Furthermore, because children are small, an employer can confine more bodies to an area. These close quarters can lead to hot environments that are fire safety hazards. Working in unsafe situations leads to health hazards, along with safety concerns. Machinery and other heavy equipment can cause children to get hurt, especially if they are new to the job and do not know how to operate the device. Sometimes, the systems produce toxic fumes in these environments that can affect a child's health later in life. Also, children can be left ignorant of labor laws, especially if their parents are illiterate, uneducated on what is right versus wrong, or if they are taken away from their parents and working against the parents' knowledge. Children

will follow the directions that adults provide them because they do not know any different, which could include either physical or emotional abuse or a combination of the two (Bureau of International Labor Affairs, n.d.-a).

Every year the International Labor Affairs Bureau researches other countries to generate reports that can be used by foreign governments to strengthen laws, policies, or programs that help children. The Bureau will also study how companies can conduct due diligence on supply chains and how consumer education can take place from their purchases (Bureau of International Labor Affairs, n.d.-a). Despite these efforts, this is still a human rights issue that countries have to address.

History and Economics of Chocolate Industries

When chocolate companies share their history, often, only the successes are discussed. A company wants to share its achievements in a positive light; however, this is not the case with all aspects of the significant chocolate industries. Chocolate is a product that many of us enjoy. According to the Fortune Business Insights report on the cocoa and chocolate market, the industry was valued at \$43.13 billion in 2017. This industry is expected to grow and reach a value of \$67.22 billion by 2025. This report included the three main uses of chocolate in 2017; 80.9 percent of the market was food and beverage, then cosmetics and pharmaceuticals made up the remaining percentages (Fortune Business Insights, 2019). This section will focus on a brief history and economic synopsis of the top seven candy companies for 2019 to provide background for future sections. An important note is that all companies will claim that child labor is a violation of human rights. The main difference between these industry leaders is whether the company has taken a stand to prevent or cause change within their supply chains (Lindell, 2019).

Mars Wrigley Confectionery, div. of Mars Inc.

Being the top company in an industry not only provides power, but it also provides a voice to promote change. The leading company in the cocoa industry is Mars Wrigley Confectionery. In 2018, they had a net sale of \$18 billion and employed over 34,000 people (Lindell, 2019). One of the goals for Mars Wrigley Confectionery is to promote a healthy planet, which they are achieving through their Sustainable In A Generation Plan (The Editors of Mars, Incorporated and its Affiliates, n.d.). Mars Wrigley Confectionery also stated that they would disclose the locations of their cocoa countries for their top suppliers. The idea is to increase transparency in the field, and in 2020 their goal is to publish action plans for countries that are not in Africa (The Editors of Mars, Incorporated and its Affiliates, n.d.). Research is another component of interest for Mars. They have their research farms in Brazil, Ecuador, and Indonesia, specifically to provide a cocoa curriculum to generate new interest in the business (The Editors of Mars, Incorporated and its Affiliates, n.d.). Despite these initiatives, Mars Wrigley Confectionery still has room for improvement, and as a leader, they could be doing more to help those within their supply chain.

Ferrero Group

Despite reaching net sales of \$12.4 billion in 2018 and employing nearly 35,000 people, the Ferrero Group has not been free from child labor allegations throughout its history (Lindell, 2019). Ferrero uses suppliers for both their hazelnuts and cocoa beans that are picked by children or forced laborers that work on the farms (Tondo, 2019). The majority of the hazelnuts used in Ferrero's famous product, Nutella, are not traceable. Traceability is critical for any industry because if there is an illness or issues with the product, the company can choose to not work with that supplier. Ferrero Group has been slow to make this change towards 100 percent hazelnut

traceability (their projected goal was by the year 2020) because, in 2019, only 39 percent could be traced (Whewell, 2019).

To combat these allegations, Ferrero established a three-pillar program called Ferrero Farming Values. The first pillar is to encourage sources originating from certified and traceable cocoa beans (they can determine what plantations the beans are from to ensure that good labor practices are in place). The next pillar is to partner with farmer groups and NGOs to encourage projects to help communities. Finally, the last pillar is to coordinate with other companies and initiatives to promote change (Ferrero, 2019). Despite these efforts, progress has been slow. In the eight years of the plan's operation, only 42,000 farmers, or a tenth of the hazelnut farmers in Turkey, received aid. Ferrero has publicly stated they are unable to trace where the hazelnuts originate unless the farmers use the Ferrero Farming Values program (Whewell, 2019). However, the company continues to use farms that are not within their program to avoid documentation. The Ferrero Group has made a public stance that practices within this industry need to change because they break human rights, and by being a big name in the industry, they can encourage other leaders to follow and follow their initiatives.

Mondelez International

Popular brands that Mondelez International holds include Cadbury (established in 1879), Oreo, and Milka (established in 1901) (The Editors of Mondelez International, n.d.). Mondelez International had a net sale of \$11.8 billion with the help of over 80,000 employees, making it the third chocolate company with the highest sales in 2018 (Lindell, 2019). This company also established its own Cocoa Life program, which promotes sustainability. According to their 2018 report, 43 percent of their cocoa volume is under this program, with plans to reach 100 percent by 2025 (The Editors of Mondelez International, 2019). One of the goals for the Cocoa Life

program is to address the causes of child labor, which includes providing families with the necessary tools and proper encouragement at a community level (The Editors of Mondelez International, 2019).

Furthermore, Mondelez International is a founding and board member of the International Cocoa Initiative. This initiative studies forced labor risk that exists within the cocoa supply chain and promotes child protection within this industry (The Editors of Mondelez International, 2019). Having a research-based program can aid all within the cocoa industry as long as they distribute the data with the means to help others.

Meiji Co. Ltd.

Meiji Co. Ltd was the chocolate company with the fourth-highest net sales at \$9.7 billion in 2018, with nearly 11,000 employees (Lindell, 2019). This Japanese-based company emphasizes the process of making chocolate and prides themselves on going to the cacao farms so they could see where the beans were coming from (Meiji Co., Ltd., n.d.). Since the start of Meiji's chocolate production in 1926, they have created multiple other products such as Marble Chocolate (1961), Hello Panda (1988), and Galbo (which are pieces of textured chocolate, 1997) (The Editors of Meiji Holdings Co., n.d.). This company continues to create new products for its consumers and be in touch with their suppliers.

The Hershey Company

Initially, the Hershey Company was not a chocolate company until 1894 when Hershey's cocoa was introduced and made available to the public (The Editors of The Hershey Company, n.d.). When Milton Hershey established his company, he made his employees a priority by building a model town to offer a better quality of life (1903-1905). This creation was

Hersheypark in 1906 and the opening of the Milton Hershey School in 1909. The Milton Hershey School's main goal was to provide orphan boys an education (The Editors of The Hershey Company, n.d.). It was not until Milton Hershey died in 1945 where new leadership took over, and changes began to take place. In the 1960s, Mars, Inc. was the top competitor for the Hershey Company, so instead of following the idea of making chocolate at a low price so that all could enjoy, the cost of the chocolate bar doubled, and the size decreased (Lewis, 2017). Additionally, in 1973 the company stopped offering tours of the factory to the public, and by the 1980s, they focused more on non-chocolate products (Lewis, 2017). Currently, the Hershey Company has 16,910 confectionery workers, and in 2018, there was a net sale of \$7.8 billion, so the brand is still thriving in the industry (Lindell 2019).

Nestle SA

Nestle did not start selling chocolate until 1904. However, their footprint in the industry did not take shape until 1929 when the company purchased Switzerland's largest chocolate company, Peter-Cailler-Kohler (the brand Cailler). This purchase shaped the sale of chocolate to be an essential product in their business (Nestlé, n.d.). Nestle has been questioned for some of its business practices in more recent years, specifically by the International Labor Rights Forum with child labor lawsuits from their cocoa farms and in 2013 for allegedly fixing the price of chocolate (The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica, 2019). In response to this negative publicity, Nestle discussed their initiatives within the industry. Their first initiative was The Nestle Cocoa Plan, which was established in 2010 to look closer into the supply chains. In 2011, Nestle became the first food company to work with the Fair Labor Association, which addresses child labor in the cocoa industry (Nestlé Company History, n.d.). In terms of current economics,

Nestle SA had a net sale of \$6.1 billion in 2018. These profits placed them as the sixth top chocolate company internationally (Lindell, 2019).

Chocoladefabriken Lindt & Sprüngli AG

Lindt and Sprüngli began in 1845 in the German-speaking part of Switzerland, where they sold chocolate in a solid form to the elite (The Editors of Chocoladefabriken Lindt & Sprüngli AG, n.d.). Rodolphe Lindt was unique in the chocolate industry because he developed a technique that was unlike others. He invented the conche, which would melt chocolate. It produced an aroma and melting characteristics that were unlike anything seen or used in the industry prior, which provided growth to the reputation of Swiss chocolate. Some of the brand names that were established by Lindt and Sprüngli include Russell Stover, Ghirardelli Chocolate Company, and Whitman's (The Editors of Chocoladefabriken Lindt & Sprüngli AG, n.d.). For the year of 2019 (January-October), Lindt and Sprüngli had a net sale of \$4.4 billion and employed around 14,000 (Lindell, 2019).

In conclusion, many companies within the chocolate industry have a platform and means to promote change. Until more pressure from governments or labor enforcing organizations is placed on these companies, their old ways will continue to ensure maximum profits. The next section will focus on cocoa production characteristics to provide an understanding of the process and how forced labor has played a significant role in this industry throughout history.

How Chocolate is Made

History of Cocoa

The key ingredient for chocolate confections is cocoa, which is found in the fruit (also known as pods) of the cacao tree, within the bean (Singh & Cook, 2018). Each pod contains

approximately 40 cacao beans, which are then dried and roasted (History.com Editors, 2017).

The cacao bean will be ground to a paste that can be formed as a chocolate liquor to be used as a cocoa powder (Singh & Cook, 2018). The scientific name for the cacao tree is *Theobroma cacao*, and it is an indigenous species to the equatorial regions of the Americas (Singh & Cook, 2018).

The earliest uses of chocolate results from the Olmec, Mayan, and Aztec civilizations. The exact timeframe for when chocolate was first used is unknown; however, historians found Olmec pots and vessels that date back to 1500 B.C. (History.com Editors, 2017). The primary purpose of cocoa was as a political tool; however, there are also roots with “Social, cultural, economic, psychological, physiological, and emotional values” (Leissle, 2018, p. 17). Cocoa was a political tool because those who had access to it would gain something, such as achieving a goal or benefit, which would allow them to assert power (Leissle, 2018). For the Mayans, chocolate was used in nearly every meal and throughout the culture (History.com Editors, 2017). For the Aztecs, cacao beans were used as currency and considered to be more valuable than gold, so the beans were mostly reserved for the wealthy (including rulers), special occasions (such as weddings), and for the military because Montezuma II (a powerful Aztec ruler) believed that chocolate was a source of energy (History.com Editors, 2017).

In Mayan and Aztec cultures, the cocoa pods served as religious purposes, specifically to make drinks that could be included in rituals with high significance, which is how Swedish botanist Carl Linnaeus designated the term “*Theobroma*” meaning “food of the gods” as the first part of the scientific name (Leissle, 2018, p. 28). The beverage was made from sun-dried shelled beans, where the broken kernels were roasted in earthen pots to be later ground to a paste over a small fire (Singh & Cook, 2018). Once the paste formed into small cakes, it was left to harden under a tree to subsequently be broken up, mixed with hot water, and beaten until a foamy

consistency was formed to create what was called xocoatl (meaning “bitter water”) (Singh & Cook, 2018). Although the Spanish guarded this recipe for nearly 100 years, once it spread to other European countries in the early 1600s, the chocolate bar became popular (Singh & Cook, 2018).

The Europeans learned about cocoa beans in 1502 after Christopher Columbus completed his fourth voyage to the Americas and returned to Spain (Singh & Cook, 2018). Due to European colonization, the indigenous people became slaves, and they were responsible for cultivating cacao to meet the demand of the Europeans (Leissle, 2018, p. 37). When violence and disease broke out against the Europeans in the mid-1600s, there were not enough indigenous people to grow the crop, so those that were still alive became involved with forced labor (Leissle, 2018, p. 37). Then, in the 1800s, Central and South America lost their production dominance when cacao beans were traded throughout the equatorial regions. The beans went to places where the environment could support the crop (Leissle, 2018, p. 37).

In 1828, a Dutch chemist, Coenraad Johannes van Houten, discovered what is now known as “Dutch cocoa” through a process called “Dutch processing.” This process involves treating cocoa beans with alkaline salts so that the product, powdered chocolate, is easier to mix with water. Van Houten also invented the cocoa press, which separates cocoa butter (a product that is much more expensive) from roasted cocoa beans to make the cocoa powder used in a wide selection of chocolate products (History.com Editors, 2017). In 1876, Daniel Peter of Switzerland created milk chocolate by adding dried milk after putting the cocoa through the cocoa press (Singh & Cook, 2018). The invention of the cocoa press revolutionized the chocolate industry because it made the production of chocolate easier and more affordable, hence leading to commercialization.

Rudolph Lindt also played a significant role in the cocoa industry when he created the chocolate-making conche for milk chocolate in 1879. The leading role of the conche is to develop the chocolate flavor (this can be done by adding more milk or sugar, depending on the company and product they are making), to compose a darker color, to ensure the all of the chocolate is the same consistency, and to lower the moisture. This process was used by other chocolate company's such as the Hershey Company because it created a taste that was liked by many (National Museum of American History, n.d.).

Despite being indigenous to the Americas, most of today's cocoa production takes place in West Africa. The top producers in Africa are Côte d'Ivoire (also known as the Ivory Coast; 40 percent), Ghana (20 percent), Nigeria (5 percent), and Cameroon (5 percent). While in the Asia-Pacific region, there is a 10 percent contribution, which is mostly from Indonesia. Central and South America produce less than 20 percent to complete the rest of the world's cocoa production (Leissle, 2018, p. 5). Labor is needed to keep the crop growing, so once many of the indigenous people of Central and South American died, Europeans turned to West Africa to be the dominant location for the growth of this crop. West Africa is a region that possesses the people available to work and contains the proper growing environment.

Forced Labor in the Cocoa Industry

The cocoa industry is an industry, like many where farming is involved, requiring long hours, hard labor in the sun, and heat, only to produce little profits. Since the cacao tree only grows in a limited environment of the world, farmers who own land where this crop is grown do what they can to maintain the land. As of 2018, farmers that grow cocoa own only a few hectares of land and provide for 90 percent of cocoa production (Leissle, 2018). Growing cocoa is not a short-term process. It takes three to five years for the trees to begin producing fruit after being

planted; however, the crop will continue to produce fruit for about twenty-five years (Leissle, 2018). During this time, farmers must have another source of income to cover agriculture costs and live during the starting phases of the industry.

The cocoa industry has had issues with unfair labor since the beginning with Aztec rulers. It was believed and demanded by the rulers that cocoa should be contributed to the kings (Leissle, 2018). In Côte d'Ivoire, where the highest number of cocoa exports exist, "41 percent of the non-family cocoa farm employees were recruited for labor, and of that 41 percent, 29 percent stated that they were told not to leave the cocoa farm" (Leissle, 2018, p. 132). Most farms require family support because the crop is an investment for the whole family. Also, it was found by an International Institute of Tropical Agriculture survey that this is an industry with "Stagnant technology, low yields, and increasing demand for unskilled workers trapped in a circle of poverty" (Ryan, 2012, pp. 60-61).

Children on cocoa farms are exposed to dangerous machinery and tools, such as "Machetes, fires, carrying heavy objects, and harmful pesticides or chemicals used in farming" (Ryan, 2012, p. 48). The ILO has established guidelines and laws for countries to follow in terms of the maximum number of hours a child can work and what activities are allowed for different ages. Despite the laws in place, in Ghana, more than half of the children on cocoa farms who are responsible for weeding, harvesting cocoa, and carrying beans across the farm, reported an injury. Multiple studies have been conducted since 2000 that report children completing tasks that violate ILO laws, such as land clearing with either chemicals or fires (Ryan, 2012).

Cocoa bean processing is a multi-step procedure consisting of harvesting, fermentation, cleaning, roasting, grinding, conching, and molding. There are two main periods in the year

where cocoa beans can be harvested: October to February and May to August. Machetes are used to cut the ripe seed pods from the trees and open the pods to reveal pulp that surrounds the beans. Fermentation takes place for five to seven days. The purpose is to kill the germ in the seed because that allows the flavor to develop. The moisture from the pulp is absorbed in the beans during this step as well. After fermentation, the beans are sun-dried so that they are not oversaturated with water. The purpose behind cleaning, roasting, and grinding is to remove any contaminants, promote flavor development, reduce acidity, and make it easier to remove the shell during the next step. Then, cracking and fanning take place. Cracking is to open the shells and separate them by weight to break the cell walls. This step will release cocoa butter, which is used to form a paste called chocolate liquor that can then be conched for further flavor development. Lastly, molding will take place to cast the chocolate into the desired shape and size, which can then be sold to confectioners for further production (Singh & Cook, 2018).

West African countries are known to have many families that are poor and struggle to make a living, and, in most industries, it is the farmers who struggle the most, not those selling the goods directly to consumers. The cocoa industry is not any different. The people who transport and trade cocoa only gain 2 percent of the profits made, while the chocolate manufacturers take 44 percent (Leissle, 2018). Chocolate is not widely consumed in West Africa, mostly due to food culture, but also because the price is too high for families (Ryan, 2012). As a result, many cocoa farm laborers do not know what chocolate tastes like, even though the product could not be made without their efforts. In 2016, when cocoa was traded, the value was around \$12 billion; however, once chocolate confectioneries processed the beans to be chocolate, the value was \$100 billion (Leissle, 2018). There is not an easy solution to this problem because if the prices of chocolate bars increased, many consumers would not be willing to pay more

money for chocolate. Further, if chocolate industries have to pay more for various components of the supply chain, leadership within the chocolate companies would not obtain the bonuses or salaries they value. Chocolate has been a lower price since the beginning, thus causing a change now would lead to discrepancies, even though change needs to happen for the safety and well-being of the laborers involved.

Although it is essential to know what the steps are to make cocoa, it is also necessary to understand what role laborers have in the cocoa industry. Laborers are appointed different tasks depending on what time of year it is and what stage the cocoa trees are at in development. Everyone does not participate in the same tasks. Children, females, and males are assigned specific roles due to their size and social norms. Thus, how these factors contribute to the life of a cocoa worker will be discussed next.

What is a Laborer in the Cocoa Industry Asked to Do?

Age Range and Demographics

Children are not the only ones participating in forced labor on cocoa farms. Although adults have more control over where they work, children do not and can be involved in this practice by either their parents or a stranger. However, in most cases where the parents are involved in forced labor, the children will follow (The Minderoo Foundation Pty Ltd., n.d.). The cocoa industry is unique because “Cocoa farming remains a small, family enterprise” compared to many other crops that are cultivated in large quantities (Cocoa Initiative, 2016).

Between 2013 and 2017, there were around 708,000 children (ages 10-17) working in the cocoa industry in Ghana. Of that group, 668,000 (94 percent) were performing child labor by definition (The Minderoo Foundation Pty Ltd., n.d.). Some children may be working in the cocoa

industry; however, they may have fewer hours or attend school. These factors are how farmers can avoid child labor laws. Much of the population in Ghana are children under the age of 15 at 37.1%, based on 2017 statistics (Lawler, Mundt, Comhaire, & The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica, 2019). Côte d'Ivoire had similar numbers of child labor at 93 percent (The Minderoo Foundation Pty Ltd., n.d.).

Today, an estimated 2.1 million children are working in the cocoa sector in just Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire alone. Additionally, not a single company or government is close to its commitment to a 70 percent reduction of child labor by 2020 (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018, p. 3). Younger generations do not want to take over the farms due to the low profits in the industry and increasing production costs, so the average age of a cocoa farmer is over 50 years old (Fairtrade Foundation, n.d.-a).

Additionally, there are difficulties accessing healthcare in West Africa, so this poses problems for farmers who fall sick. Malaria is one of the leading causes of death for children under the age of five in Côte d'Ivoire (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018). When children become ill, adult farmers and laborers are impacted as well because they will have to care for the children. In some instances, this could cause them to become sick as well. According to one study on vegetable farmers in Côte d'Ivoire, by missing more than two days in a growing season, the farmers had 47 percent lower yields and 53 percent lower revenues compared to those that missed less than two days (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018, p. 49).

In West Africa, women operate approximately 25 percent of the cocoa plantations because men have more access to land rights, extensions services, credits, and certification (Fairtrade Foundation, n.d.-a). It is highly likely that more women own land, specifically in Ghana, because with reporting, there are biases towards female farmers (Marston, 2016). There

are also discrepancies with females owning land and the income they generate, according to the African Development Bank. Despite making up for a quarter of the cocoa plantation ownerships and over half of the labor force in Côte d'Ivoire, they only earn 21 percent of the income generated (Marston, 2016). Aside from cocoa production, women will also oversee the household duties, which is a time-consuming job by itself. The average family size living on a West African farm is eight people (Cocoa Initiative, 2016). Women often are overlooked, and their work goes unrecognized in this industry, despite being a central role in the community and the sustainability of the cocoa supply chain.

Besides these obstacles, social norms determine what jobs a woman can take part in on a cocoa farm, even if she owns the land. Women are sometimes viewed as having fewer physical capabilities, which is an additional factor influencing social norms. For example, specific tasks, such as completing the steps to clear a field (making the land flat, weeding, and spraying pesticides) are only tasks that a man can do. So, a woman is forced to find a man to do the work (Leissle, 2018). Furthermore, if a woman is not able to ask her husband, brothers, sons, uncles, or cousins to do the work, she will have to look elsewhere. This social norm can result in females spending some of the small earnings on labor or be taken advantage of by outside laborers (Leissle, 2018). The issues with social norms are not specific to a particular region in the cocoa industry; instead, this is something that many industries across the world face, making it challenging to be a female with power.

Tools Used

The tools used in this industry vary depending on the task performed. It is common for a laborer to not receive proper training with the tools that they are required to use, which can result in injuries that can affect the long-term health of the individual (Mull & Kirkhorn, 2005). There

is a range of supplies needed at the start of the primary season that can cause debt for the farmers; “Fertilizer, pesticides, and fungicides, boots, and cutlasses (machetes)” (Leissle, 2018, p. 106). If a farmer spends too much money at the beginning of the season, it can become difficult to recover, resulting in debt transferring from one year to the next. Currently, as technology has made improvements, there are new agriculture solutions to help the work of farmers become easier; however, as with any piece of technology, there are added costs to the farmers. This could be in the form of the equipment itself, or it could be with the upkeep of the tools.

There are also many educational trainings and new initiatives that cocoa companies and development agencies have made to help farmers. The problem is that many are not able to attend due to the costs and time that the events will require or farmers believing they do not need more training (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018). Some of the educational trainings may be on the use of new farming techniques that will make the life of a farmer and laborer easier. Due to the time that education takes farmers away from their fields, farmers continue using their old techniques and tools (Cocoa Initiative, 2016).

Between August 2016 and August 2017, slightly over 94 percent or 668,000 children in Ghana were victims of child labor, and of those children, 632,000 or 89 percent participated in hazardous work (The Minderoo Foundation Pty Ltd., n.d.). Hazardous work is defined as carrying heavy amounts of beans (89 percent) or using sharp tools (71 percent) (The Minderoo Foundation Pty Ltd., n.d.). Some of the tools that the laborers (including children) are required to use can be considered primitive. Consequently, there may not be safety precautions included that many modern tools contain.

The soil used for the cocoa trees has been degraded by the constant growth of the same crop. There has been a “Decline in soil nutrients, loss of soil organic matter, increase in soil acidity, and the breakdown of soil textural characteristics” (Sunday, 2017). Cocoa farmers learned in 1994 that fertilizers were a necessity because approximately 72 percent of farmers that did not use fertilizers only produced about 384 kilograms of cocoa, while those that did use fertilizers produced about 1,300 kilograms (Snoeck et al., 2009). Therefore, cocoa farmers are required to use fertilizers to replenish the soil and to maintain their crops. Fertilizers contain chemicals, and if the proper precautions are not implemented, harmful health effects can take place later in life.

With the growth of any crop, there is a fear of disease. In the cocoa sector, there is the application of costly agrochemicals; however, this leads to high levels of contamination in ecosystems and more resistant strains of pests and diseases if the substance is not applied correctly (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018). By contaminating the ecosystem, this will only impact future cocoa farmers and other industries. Additionally, many of the laborers do not receive information on how to properly apply the agrochemicals, which can result in more harm than good (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018).

Tasks Performed and Environmental Impact

The workday for a laborer consists of long hours in the sun, and with the crop only growing near the equator, there are high temperatures in this environment as well. Some laborers will be required to walk great distances either to get to the farm or while at the farm (Schrage & Ewing, 2005).

There are a series of steps involved with cocoa farming. Before the collection of the crop, the land has to be cleared, which consists of using machetes. Pesticides and fertilizers have to be applied to allow for a healthy, prosperous crop. Once the pods can be collected, they are carried by hand to where processing can begin. This step often results in carrying heavy loads so that fewer trips back and forth are made. That practice can result in sprains or other injuries to any part of the body. The processing step includes using a machete, again, to open the pods to reveal the beans, which then need to be dried (Schrage & Ewing, 2005).

Both men and women can physically do the work completed on cacao farms. There are specific tasks, such as spraying pesticides, that men will exclusively complete because men believe that the machinery is too heavy for women (Leissle, 2018). This stereotyping causes the work that women do, such as planting, to be devalued, despite being an integral component of the farm's future. Thus, social constructs and expectations have shaped the way this industry has evolved.

Children are required to do other tasks that adults may not be able to do because of their size and physical capabilities. One of the most dangerous tasks that children are engaged in is climbing trees greater than nine feet and pruning the trees with a sharp object. Children may also be asked to mix, load, and apply pesticides using a pesticide backpack spray. Most of the time children do not have personal protective equipment while participating in this task (Mull & Kirkhorn, 2005).

Cocoa farmers used to use the "slash-and-burn" technique to create new fields; however, now that there are not any new areas of land, cocoa has turned to a sedentary crop (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018, p. 17). Deforestation is a growing concern and problem for cocoa farmers, particularly in Côte d'Ivoire, wherein 1960, there were 16 million hectares of rainforest to only 2

million in 2010. West African countries have put protections on the forest land that is left; however, in Côte d'Ivoire, between 30 and 40 percent of the cocoa harvested there is from protected land, making the harvests illegal. Another land issue that cocoa farmers experience is that many do not have official land titles. The land is often passed down through generations informally or through traditional tenure systems, which creates problems for the sustainability efforts and for obtaining credits to invest in a farm (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018).

Living and Working as a Cocoa Farmer

Every country has an environment and culture that shapes who the people are that live there. Cocoa farming families are not any different. Men and women each have specified roles and responsibilities for the income that they obtain. Often, families in West Africa will maintain separate budgets and control their earnings to ensure they can cover the costs of their responsibilities. For example, men will cover the costs of the crops grown and housing fees, while women will pay for the household commodities for the family (Leissle, 2018). The work completed on the farm is also separated based on gender.

In most cases, the men will be responsible for the export crops and selling all the products, while women will be responsible for the plants and goods that the family will use. This system can pose problems because many of the cocoa farmers, specifically in Ghana, are illiterate and innumerate. When the male does not keep a documented record of the sales made, it is unknown if the female is receiving the proper amount or if budgets are separate, where to allot the money. Furthermore, men are the recipients of the cash from the sales primarily. So, they can easily decide to spend the money on something other than what is budgeted. Examples include alcohol or repaying the debts owed for farming goods before handing the females any money for the necessities in her budget, causing a shortage to build in the females' budget (Leissle, 2018).

When the females are in charge of the budget, it is common that they will reinvest in their families, children, and communities, which in turn will increase the overall well-being of all within the cocoa-growing family (Marston, 2016).

Due to the cacao crop only growing during select months of the year, a cocoa farmer does not receive a structured income, unlike most jobs. Farm owners will hire daily laborers when the season is busy to ensure the farm is operating at its highest potential. However, when the workers receive their wages, it is dependent on what cash the farm owner has available, making the pay variable (Leissle, 2018). One individual involved in forced labor had an annual income of 30 new Ghana cedis, which is the equivalent of \$21. He told the reporter that he “ate twice a day and shared a foam mattress with two other laborers in a mud hut with a zinc roof” (Ryan, 2012, p. 57). Having the primary source of income for a farmer be at one part of the year poses challenges financially for the family, which can lead to debt. The farmers will have to pay for the tools necessary for the labor, then living conditions before being able to provide a wage for the workers. To make up for the lack of income during the off-season, families will participate in other types of work, such as working in a small business selling other items (this work amounts to 20 percent of the annual income; the cacao crop accounts for 80 percent of the yearly income) (Leissle, 2018).

Recently, between 2016 and 2017, cocoa farmers experienced even more hardship compared to the annual issues they consistently have. During this season, the price of cocoa decreased by more than a third due to disease and the age of the cocoa trees (Fairtrade Foundation, n.d.-a). Farmers in Ghana were the only ones not to be entirely affected because of the government-subsidized price of cocoa (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018). The cost of living

is lower in both Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana; however, the income that a cocoa farmer receives still does not reach the living income.

Living income is the net income a household would need to earn to enable all members of the household to afford a decent standard of living. Elements of a decent standard of living thereby include: food, water, housing, education, health care, transport, clothing, and other essential needs including provision for unexpected events.

-Living Income Practitioners' Workshop hosted by ISEAL & GIZ, Eschborn, 2015

The daily income is \$2.51, while the current cocoa farmer daily income is \$0.78 (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018). This price difference is evidence that cocoa farmers are in a cycle of debt and living in poverty but doing their best to maintain the land and crops that they own. Further, many cocoa farmers do not communicate with one another to organize and purchase supplies in bulk. If this action were done, cocoa farmers would be paying less, be obtaining helpful market information, or securing a better price for their cocoa, which allows them to earn more (Cocoa Initiative, 2016).

The farmers are at the mercy of the world market price, which increases or decreases depending on the demand, stocks, and current and future supply of the beans. Consequently, farmers have no say in what the price is (Leissle, 2018). When the farmers sell their beans, they are selling at the farm gate price, which is dependent on the world market price, except for those in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana who have a cocoa marketing board (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018). This board in Ghana, also called the Cocobod, is responsible for providing a fixed-price to protect providers from getting cheated by the use of rigged scales (Ryan, 2012). Furthermore, most of the sales take place in locations where there is little authority or control over the sale of

the beans. Large companies can take advantage of this system because of how decentralized the cocoa industry is, with approximately 6 million farmers globally (Fairtrade Foundation, n.d.-a). Farmers often suffer from corruption, such as not being allowed to see the scale to know if the buyer is giving them the correct amount of money (Leissle, 2018). This lack of transparency and the ability to rely on governments or companies all affect the farmers' livelihoods. Thus, many factors contribute to how a family of cocoa farmers will survive to the next year and countless obstacles presented to them, making this industry a difficult one to be a participant in.

Forced labor within the cocoa industry is a significant concern. Survivors of forced labor endure psychological and physical effects that can last a lifetime. Being able to comprehend the factors and circumstances that lead one into a life involved with labor trafficking can be difficult. Looking from an outside perspective can make one believe that it is easy to change; however, for some, working in agriculture is their way of life, and all those families know. Therefore, obtaining an understanding of how people become involved with forced labor and lifelong effects is essential to understanding how this issue can be changed for future generations.

Survivors of Forced Labor

How Do People Get Involved With Forced Labor?

Those who have never completed physical labor on a farm or in a factory may find it challenging to understand how a person becomes involved in a forced labor situation. The world is divided into various cultures, where there are different perspectives and opinions. In the United States, only 1.3 percent of the labor force consists of farmers, which also poses problems when trying to understand the impact that farming has on other societies (Lepley, 2019).

One of the main reasons why forced labor has become more popular amongst agriculture and factory producing industries is that the cost of labor has decreased. This change in price affected the economy through supply and demand (Bales, 2012). There are now many people available to work in forced labor industries, and traffickers have taken advantage of this by using people as commodities and tools in a process.

The enslaved fieldworker who cost the equivalent of \$40,000 in 1850 costs less than \$100 today. This dramatic fall in price has forever altered the basic economic equation of slavery.

- Kevin Bales, *Ending Slavery: How We Free Today's Slaves*, 2012, p. 12

The most common story surrounding forced labor is that a stranger will approach a village and offer a child in a family a better chance at life. This offer could be in the form of teaching the child a skill that they believe could be applied to the child's future. The child and family will take part in the opportunity because it would be one less mouth to worry about, and the child could receive a better education, something that the village did not have to offer. Once the trafficker brings the child to their new line of work, it is not what the child expects. In some cases, it could be working on a cocoa farm in the hot sun for long hours doing difficult physical labor. The trafficker may barely feed or provide a living situation for the child and make it challenging for the child to escape, whether that be through manipulation tactics or from scaring the child. Once the child is involved with this situation, it is difficult to find a way of escape (Ryan, 2012).

In places such as Mali or Burkina Faso, the families are so poor that the promise of a bicycle, clothes, or money is enough to tempt the child into speaking to a trafficker so they can learn more. For these children, hearing about the chance to work on a cocoa farm is the best-case

scenario for them; “Children say going to Côte d’Ivoire to cocoa farms is like picking gold off the tree” (Ryan, 2012, p. 55). They truly believe what the traffickers are telling them will happen, so they agree to go, only to get disappointed when their expectations are not fulfilled (Ryan, 2012).

Deception is not only related to what the children expect to receive, but it is also used to describe how many hours they are required to work, what conditions they will be living in, the earnings they will be given, and how long they will be required to work there. In some instances, before even working for the trafficker, the laborer may owe the trafficker money for recruitment and transportation costs (Verité, Inc., 2019). Recruitment costs can include identifying documentation to travel across country borders, which traffickers may withhold from laborers. Without identifying documentation of who one is, it poses more challenges and risks when trying to escape (Verité, Inc., 2019). This debt can also function as a hold on the laborers because they cannot leave until they repay their debt. To increase the debt, the trafficker may add other costs such as interest, transportation, food, housing, or new clothes (Verité, Inc., 2019).

Education is a significant concern for many families. Most parents want to provide their children with a chance to receive an education; however, that is not possible all the time. In West Africa, some classes are held outside and take away time that the child could be working. In remote areas, there is a lack of or low level of literacy and accessibility to receive help on what the employment options may constitute. Traffickers will take advantage of this factor by having recruitment contracts that may be challenging to understand and contain details that keep the child in the forced labor situation (Verité, Inc., 2019).

With farming families, it is common for everyone to work together to provide for each other. Many families where children get involved in forced labor situations can stem from

economic hardships. The parents will often weigh all their options and do their best to choose what they believe would benefit both the child and the family the most. In some cases, having a child working instead of being in school is the difference between that child having food or not (Leissle, 2018). Food may be more accessible at the school, but there is also the consideration of whether corporal punishment is used at school or on the farm. The parents will look at the factors for their situation and how they would impact the health, safety, and livelihood of each child (Leissle, 2018). Families do not allow their child to get involved with a trafficking situation out of spite or animosity towards their child; it is from a place of doing the child a favor and helping them prepare for their future.

A change within the family structure can also result in changes in the livelihood of all. In cases where a divorce takes place, the mother may become more reliant on her children to help support the household (Leissle, 2018, p. 137). Due to many West African families being larger (the average household is eight people), when a family breaks up from divorce, that can mean losing valuable providers to the household income (Cocoa Initiative, 2016). Specifically, in the Ashanti region of Ghana, divorce is not uncommon (both men and women can file) because it is a way for the female to regain control of unfairly distributed household resources (Leissle, 2018). The children commonly remain with the mother; however, with social norms and the treatment towards women as discussed in the prior section, this leaves females with few options, especially when the male refuses to pay for the care of the children (Leissle, 2018).

Besides financial reasons, some children become involved with forced labor as a “rite of passage” (Ryan, 2012, p. 51). Some children will voluntarily leave their home villages in search of work after being returned home by organizations that are trying to help people live a different life that is safe from labor trafficking. Members in their village may have left, so this is viewed

as common practice for some people. In some situations, the child may not want to return home after being trafficked because the life that they created and the work they are doing on the cocoa farm is something they would not be able to have at home (Ryan, 2012). The laborers may be proud of the work that they did, such as looking at a field after they cleared it because the work they did was challenging (Leonard & Berlan, 2009). Some children will leave their parents to help other family members as an apprenticeship or confiage, which is an informal foster system. This choice could be due to other factors listed prior, such as the other family members being able to offer a skill or them having the ability to help (Verité, Inc., 2019).

Psychological Effects

When a child leaves his or her family to work on a cocoa farm, they are often all alone without their family to support them or talk to them. Parents often teach children valuable lessons that they can use later in their lives; without that connection, they are losing that precious opportunity and memories. The children working on the farms have to rely on their coworkers who can be in similar situations as they are. There have been instances where children as young as nine years of age were working alone on these farms (Off, 2014). Further, many cocoa farms are isolated in densely forested regions where there are only footpaths to access them. This isolation may leave a laborer feeling alone and as though alternate employment is impossible to achieve (Verité, Inc., 2019).

The deception that traffickers use can impact children as they become older (Verité, Inc., 2019). They may experience difficulties trusting other people because the trafficker told them they would receive either new objects, a better life, or better wages for their work, even though they do not receive those things. Trust is necessary for many parts of life, whether it be through society, employment, or relationships with family, friends, or significant others. A laborer forms

a bond with his or her trafficker. Understanding or realizing that what the trafficker did was wrong can be challenging to look past. Once trust breaks, it can be challenging to rebuild or get back, which can affect future relationships. Other qualities go into the level of trust that a person has; reliability and dependability, transparency, competency, sincerity and authenticity, fairness, openness, and vulnerability (Jaffe, 2018). Some of these qualities overlap with other components of life, such as how a child communicates with others. For example, if a child learns that by being open and vulnerable with people only produced negative results, when they interact with others, they may choose to state the minimum amount of information that answers a question. If they do not provide enough information, questions may follow, and that can cause someone to open up more than they intend, placing them in a vulnerable situation. Thus, breaking trust or a level of trust can make an individual feel vulnerable and increase his or her anxiety levels (Jaffe, 2018).

Depression, anxiety, and fear are all common effects of working in a forced labor situation. Children may be missing their family, be unhappy with their working or living situation, afraid of what their trafficker would do, or be confused by everything they are enduring. All of these are risk factors for anxiety and depression, which will make working even more challenging because they are doing something that they may not want to do or be living a life they did not expect. For example, take a nineteen-year-old boy is working on a cocoa farm. The boy is unhappy with his situation, even though the farmer was providing him food and housing. The boy believes that if he complains, he will risk making his situation worse (Verité, Inc., 2019). For this boy, his fear is impacting his happiness, and he does not know how to change his circumstances. Every person has dreams and goals that he or she wishes to

accomplish, and the feelings relating to entrapment on a cocoa farm can diminish the interest in those goals and desires.

Additionally, witnessing an injury take place can be traumatizing for both the injured individual and those around them. Depending on the seriousness of the injury, it could scare all involved from wanting to use that tool again. This fear could arise from that injury happening to them. This experience could also cause more anxiety about completing tasks, so one may choose to complete the task slower to be more cautious. The downside to taking time on work is that physical abuse or replacement and additional anxiety or concerns about their future could follow. This circumstance can also cause stress from not being able to perform to the expectations of the farm owner or trafficker (Murray & Khan, 2007).

Sexual assault and exploitation can take place on cocoa farms. Many laborers will be working away from others who would be in villages or the fields, so it can be easy to take advantage of another individual (Murray & Khan, 2007). This abuse could result in teenage pregnancies, which will cause other psychological and emotional issues. The pregnant child laborer is barely able to support themselves, and now there is another life to take care of with their low income (Leonard & Berlan, 2009). Many of the trafficked children within Ghana are used for labor or commercial sexual exploitation (Bureau of International Labor Affairs, n.d.-b). Despite there being differences in these types of trafficking, there can be overlaps between them, especially with sexual exploitation on cocoa farms.

Being that many cocoa farms are in forests away from other people, obtaining an education can be a challenge. Some schools require fees to either cover the cost of the school's upkeep or to provide the teachers with a salary. These fees would be an added cost for either parents or the trafficker, which may not be feasible for those in poor communities. Another

challenge is that some schools require birth certificates; however, some children do not have these identification documents. Based on a study conducted by Tulane University, 29.2 percent of children working in cocoa production did not attend school in 2012-2013 (Verité, Inc., 2019, p. 45). Not attending school prevents children from learning basic skills that can help them later in life. This lack of expertise could be literacy skills (which could allow them to understand labor-related contracts), writing, and basic mathematics (which could help with necessary household budgets and wages). Literacy skills can also correlate to vocabulary, and one's understanding of words because being able to speak a language is different from being literate in a language. Not having these skills can impact these children, especially when they are older and decide to have their own families. The children can follow their parents, creating a cycle.

Physical Effects

Every forced labor situation is different. Often the laborers only receive one or two meals a day (Off, 2014). With all the manual labor performed, it can be challenging to keep up with the calories the laborers are burning and what food they are given. If there is a lack of nutrition, this can pose problems for growing muscle tone and feeling fatigued from the long hours in the hot sun. The warm sun can cause heat-related symptoms and dehydration because the work takes place within the equator region. Children will often complete repeated tasks without taking a break because they fear replacement or do not understand what their body is telling them when they are overworking themselves. Also, while working outside, there are environmental concerns such as what insects or animals may be present. So, some laborers are concerned with snake bites or bee stings (Mull & Kirkhorn, 2005). Further, it is rare for a forced laborer to have his or her bed or space. They often must share either the mattress or room with multiple other people (Off, 2014).

Additionally, some children hardly have any clothing. The trafficker would not want to spend their own money to provide the forced laborer clothes, especially a child who is continuously growing because this would be an added cost. Many children have limited amounts of clothing to protect themselves and are often barefoot (Off, 2014). Without having shoes, this exposes their feet to open cuts, scrapes, and sores. If other bacteria get inside these wounds, other more severe health problems can take place, and worst-case scenario, prevent the child from being able to work. If the child cannot work due to an injury, he or she can return to their family because, in the trafficker's eyes, they are useless. Not being able to work would affect their future because they would be an added cost to their family to feed and not able to help the household.

Not receiving training on how to use the provided tools poses a risk to the laborer and those around them. For example, a laborer may be instructed that they must use a machete and a flashlight at night to do their work (Verité, Inc., 2019). This task poses a risk of injury to the laborer because they are focused on holding two objects, one of which can easily cut through skin and muscle, causing a potentially fatal injury. Those around this laborer could be at risk because the laborer using the machete may not know how to use the tool properly. After all, they do not realize the threat and danger it poses.

Pesticides are widely used across cocoa farms because they increase the crop yields; however, education on the hazards of pesticides are not always available to those who are applying them. For example, a laborer may receive little to no training on what precautions to use when they are mixing, loading, applying, storing, or disposing of the chemicals (Mull & Kirkhorn, 2005). Exposure to pesticides can have harmful effects on one's lungs, brain, and skin if they do not use proper personal protective equipment. Most of the time, this equipment was

not available to the child laborers, but occasionally it would be open to the adult laborers. Some laborers have experienced “headaches, burning eyes and skin, dermal rashes, coughing, nausea, and dizziness” from applying pesticides (Mull & Kirkhorn, 2005, p. 652).

Other hazardous tools include long and short cutlasses, sosa (which are long bamboo poles with cutting knives attached to them), chainsaws, and pesticide backpack spray devices. Further, children may have to climb the trees at heights greater than nine feet with a sharp tool to prune the trees. This task could result in injury for the child if they fall (often they do not have safety equipment) or for those below because branches or cocoa pods may fall without the person on the ground realizing there is someone above them (Mull & Kirkhorn, 2005). When using the sharp tools to open the cocoa pods, most laborers experience pain in their hands and wrists, along with some having severed fingers (Mull & Kirkhorn, 2005, p. 652).

Repeatedly carrying large, heavy bags of cocoa beans will take its toll on anyone’s body, including a child who is still growing and developing. A full bag of dried cocoa beans can weigh anywhere between 60 and 65 kilograms (Mull & Kirkhorn, 2005). Growth and development are critical to consider for the children working on cocoa farms because, during puberty and growth spurts, there is a decrease in flexibility. This growth can result in increased injuries during this time, which can have lifelong impacts and limitations placed on their bodies (Mull & Kirkhorn, 2005). Sometimes all the weight can cause sores on the young boy’s backs and shoulders. In addition to the large bags, the wounds could be the result of physical abuse. In some situations, laborers must work at gunpoint; however, this information can be difficult to share because traffickers do not want the laborers to talk to officials (Off, 2014). Aside from sores, the physical work often causes pain in the neck, back, shoulders, and arms, with injuries being strains and sprains throughout the body (Mull & Kirkhorn, 2005).

If a laborer is injured while working on the cocoa farm, immediate medical attention is not readily available. Being that cocoa farms are in forests that are sometimes only accessible by walking through narrow pathways, getting help for a serious injury may not be possible. As of 2015, “Fewer than 50 percent of Africans have access to modern health facilities, and many African countries spend less than 10 percent of their GDP on health care” (Clausen, 2015). Unlike the United States, health care is not viewed as high, which can also account for premature deaths. Individuals are forced to rely on his or her first aid knowledge to cure any illnesses or concerns that they have regarding health.

Further, the capabilities of the health care system in Africa are overall lacking. Africa is known to have counterfeit pharmaceuticals and sweltering medical clinics that only have the bare necessities for medical equipment. Additionally, obtaining a specialist’s opinion for a medical problem is mostly reserved for the elite. Therefore, a trafficked cocoa farmer will not have access to a general doctor to treat them if they contract AIDS, malaria, or other noncommunicable diseases such as hypertension (Clausen, 2015). Some diseases have cures from the growth of technology, but due to the lack of infrastructure and government support, people are unable to get the care they need to survive curable diseases.

Like many practices in Africa, the cocoa industry could benefit from advancements in technology and change. Organizations have begun to create plans to help cocoa farmers without forcing them to alter his or her lives. Some victims do not realize they are victims, so it is essential to communicate with those involved to help everyone understand each circumstance. Consumers also play a major role in this industry because they are supplying the demand for products containing cocoa. In order to prevent psychological and physical harm, the cocoa industry requires change.

Conclusion

Victim Help

Before being able to help victims of child labor or forced labor, chocolate companies must address and understand how these practices cause problems in their supply chain. In recent years, chocolate companies have been implementing new monitoring and remediation systems as attempts to stop the use of child labor. Change in this industry is going to take time, and adjustments will need to be made along the way to address the years of neglect on this issue. Victims and survivors in the cocoa industry need different types of help. Child labor victims may require guidance on getting out of their situation, while survivors may need aid to figure out how to move on from their experience (Food Empowerment Project, n.d.). Additionally, there is an abundance of paperwork involved to identify child labor cases. Companies and governments of both cocoa consuming nations and cocoa-producing nations all need to work together to help victims. Otherwise, the same trends will continue as long as traffickers can take advantage of people's vulnerabilities.

Communication is one of the main problems in this industry. Lessons learned about successful initiatives are not brought to public attention so, corporations tend to try the same failed methods. This problem is a task for both governments and chocolate companies because they must be transparent and accountable with one another (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018). The lack of transparency is one of the most significant problems that this industry is facing, and many chocolate and cocoa producing companies do not want to address the issue; instead, it is easier to keep producing the chocolate that many enjoy (Food Empowerment Project, n.d.).

According to the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights (UNGPs), corporations have to undertake human rights due diligence (HRDD). This requires companies to analyze, prevent, mitigate, remediate and report on risks in their supply chain, not only for their own operations, but also for those of their suppliers.

- Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018, p. 56

In 2001, United States Senator Tom Harkin and House of Representatives Eliot Engel partnered to develop the Harkin Engel Protocol. This document was signed on September 19, 2001, by Larry Graham, who was President of the Chocolate Manufacturers Association and William Guyton, who was President of the World Cocoa Foundation. This six-part plan consisted of “a public statement of need for and terms of an action plan, the formation of multi-sectoral advisory groups, signed a joint statement on child labor to be witnessed at the ILO, memorandum of cooperation, establishment of a joint foundation, and building towards credible standards” (Chocolate Manufacturers Association, 2016, p. 2-3). This plan was signed by various Presidents and Chairmen of different chocolate companies, such as Mars Inc., Nestle Chocolate & Confections USA, Hershey Food Corporation (Chocolate Manufacturers Association, 2016). This Protocol drew attention to child labor in the supply chain in West Africa and allowed for other government documentation to follow. Documentation included the *Declaration of Joint Action to Support Implementation of the Harkin-Engel Protocol* on September 13, 2010. This Declaration builds on the Harkin Engel Protocol to cover data collection and reporting issues (International Labour Organization, 2011).

Nestlé created the Child Labour Monitoring and Remediation System (CLMRS), where the objective is “To reduce child labour related-risks in Nestlé Cocoa Plan cooperatives by targeting remediation efforts to at-risk-individuals and households.” The plan consists of

integrating different levels and having them work together because this is a multistep process. The levels would be individual, household, community, and international. Each level has a focus. For example, at the individual level, there is an emphasis on school enrollment, vocational training, and birth certificates. At the household level, women will be supported with ways to generate income. The community level will focus on training and school construction. The goals of CLMRS are on-going community-wide protection and prevention through raising awareness, monitoring of all children in the cooperative, identification of child labor cases, and remediation activities for identified cases or children at risk (International Cocoa Initiative Foundation, 2016).

In 2017, at the UN Climate Change Conference, governments of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana partnered with thirty-five leading chocolate and cocoa companies to create a "Frameworks for Action" plan. This plan focused on forest protection and restoration, sustainable cocoa production, farmers' livelihoods, and community engagement (World Cocoa Foundation, n.d.). The idea behind this plan is that if the environment is conserved, then there will not be as much of a demand for laborers to clear new fields and prevent the child labor issue from continuing to grow and expand. Governments and organizations that are working to stop trafficking will then be able to focus on what the current size of the situation is.

Being that human trafficking is not accurately documented, data is challenging to discover. Further, the data that is collected should be based on what meaningful changes were made, not just the efforts that companies or organizations have started. For example, instead of recording how many forms of aid organizations provided to child labor victims, data on the number of cases that were affected by the initiatives, and what programs were most helpful should be recorded (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018). Although not all of these new practices

are in use, and set timelines have not been met, the cocoa industry is on a step towards the right direction.

What Can Consumers Do?

One of the best ways a consumer can participate in reducing the power of leaders in the chocolate industry is by purchasing fair trade products. In 1988, the fair trade movement began in the Netherlands with Max Havelaar. Max Havelaar is an activist who stated, “Commodities from the developing world would always be sold for the cheapest price possible unless companies were forced to pay a premium” (Off, 2014, p. 290). Fairtrade is a global movement that involves all people within a supply chain, and their focus is on people and the planet, which is the foundation of many goods. Fairtrade is not just for the cocoa industry; this is for many industries such as clothing, farming, and fishing.

Fair Trade USA strives to impact communities and people through income sustainability, empowerment, individual and community well-being, and environmental stewardship (Fair Trade USA, n.d.-c). The organization will review the products and suppliers annually to ensure the farmers are still complying with the established standards. A product with the fair trade certified seal means that Fair Trade USA is working with the producers to certify the transactions that are made between the companies and products of that good. The companies are “Providing safe working conditions, protecting the environment, building sustainable livelihoods, and the people are earning additional money to empower and uplift their communities” (Fair Trade USA, n.d.-a). Reviewed products that pass will have a seal, so they stand out to consumers. Fair Trade USA is one of the few organizations that rely on transparency concerning the products they are endorsing; thus, if there are any issues, consumers should contact the organization with their concerns (Fair Trade USA, n.d.-a).

Any organization that gives a fair trade logo uses premiums. Premiums allow organizations to invest in projects that help farmers, which can later be used in their advertisements. The farmers will receive an extra sum of money on top of the selling price of the goods. The premium is calculated as a percentage of the volume of products that a farmer sells. Therefore, the premium amount will differ from product to product and across regions. Farmers can then use that money to invest in their businesses to improve their farming techniques or health and education in their community. Many cocoa farmers only own small hectares of land, so farmers are required to join together and form a co-operative to become Fair Trade certified. Certification organizations chose this method so that an elected representative within the co-operative can decide how the money is spent and to eliminate interactions with hundreds of farmers. Some industries that can be fair trade certified require farmers to spend a percentage of his or her earnings on environmental sustainability or the quality of their products (Fairtrade Foundation, n.d.-b). Thus, the premiums serve two purposes; they allow for the creation of projects and act as a draw for media attention to the positive impacts that they are creating.

Another prominent organization in this industry is the Rainforest Alliance. The Rainforest Alliance follows similar principles to Fair Trade USA; however, there is more emphasis on the environment. They encourage farmers to use agriculture methods that promote sustainability, such as grafting new trees from old rootstocks, which they will teach in training. Their approach incorporates farmers, forest communities, companies, and consumers to address environmental and social issues. Their goal involves making responsible businesses around the world a new normal. Similar to Fair Trade USA, Rainforest Alliance will also conduct annual audits to verify farmer compliance and place seals on products they approve (Rainforest Alliance, n.d.).

There are also other smaller companies besides the leading chocolate producers in the industry that are promoting change. For example, Tony's Chocolonely is a chocolate producing company that has been trying to fight the use of slave labor for the past fifteen years. Their vision is for all chocolate producers not to use forced labor. They will also pay an additional premium on top of the Fairtrade premium in the form of direct payments to farmers involved. Their five steps include: using traceable beans, paying a higher premium, cooperating with farmers to build them up, working with the farmers for at least five years so long-term investments can be made, and improving productivity so there can be less dependency on cocoa (such as better fertilizers). Just within the 2018-2019 season, Tony's Chocolonely sold over 43 million bars of chocolate and worked with over 6,000 farmers (Tony's Chocolonely, n.d.). Looking into smaller companies that are not name-branded, such as Tony's Chocolonely, is another way consumers can aid this industry.

Labels may not always tell the full truth; however, this is the best method that consumers can use for determining which products have the highest chance of being produced without forced labor. One of the best practices that consumers can do is conduct their research on items that they use in their household. Consumers can look at the labels on the sides of packages and see if the product is fair trade certified or made without forced labor. Below is an example of a Fair Trade Certified logo for reference.



Fair Trade Certified Logo (Fair Trade USA, n.d.-b)

Commonly confused phrases that companies use are the terms “certified cocoa” or “sustainable cocoa.” Certification usually refers to a step of improvement within the supply chain, while sustainable requires more effort with other companies and governments (Fountain & Huetz-Adams, 2018). Thus, it is crucial to consider the wording that is used on the packages to be an informed consumer.

The best option for consumers is to look for goods with a fair trade logo and then do their research on the brand. Every company has a plan and steps on how they will promote change, with some being more successful than others. Companies are competing with one another to make the highest number of sales. Just because a company is small does not mean they are paying their workers’ proper wages. Any company can use forced labor to produce their goods. Consumers have to look at the whole picture and educate themselves on the products they are buying. This concept demonstrates why consumers must understand labels and tactics that companies use to persuade consumers that they have the “best” product.

How Truthful is Fair Trade?

Although there are plans and companies in place trying to promote change within this industry, there are still roadblocks. The chocolate industry is riddled with companies and

organizations that do not share the whole truth with the changes they are making. This industry has made slow progress towards change, specifically with how goods are labeled. Consumers gain a false sense of raising awareness and supporting small farmers when purchasing goods that claim not to use forced labor. Companies will draw attention to the positive changes, but ignore the design flaws to the plan. For example, with Fair Trade, the details on the premium costs are not advertised, so for a consumer looking at a product in a store, they may not realize the farmers have to be part of a co-operative (Fairtrade Foundation, n.d.-b).

The premiums that organizations give for certified Fair Trade products are received by the farmers, not by the farmworkers. The farmworkers are the lowest members of the supply chain; thus, they are the ones who need the most considerable amount of support because they do not have any power. For the workers, as long as they have “Access to personal protective equipment, housing, and drinking water that is of equal quality to that of the farmers themselves,” the standards are being met. Fair Trade only requires the legal standards for wages and benefits because they do not have control over changing the law (Charles, 2019). Also, labels do not list the amount that the farmers receive. The amount can be a challenge to find because it requires research on many factors, such as the location, size of the farm, and the number of workers (Alsever, 2006). This flaw in the concept of supporting Fair Trade still puts workers at risk and does not tell the whole truth. Fair Trade may seem like one of the best options now, but this idea may only create problems in the future or reduce the level of trust consumers have with organizations and supply chains.

The added logo that fair trade organizations require acts as another fee that manufacturers have to pay. With any fee, even if it is small, it will add up over time. For 2005, TransFair USA (another fair trade certification organization) generated “\$1.89 million in licensing fees from

companies that used their logo” (Alsever, 2006). Most companies within an industry will make it a mission to reduce the number of added costs for the production of a good so that they can gain the highest profits. Those that do choose to use a fair trade certified logo add that cost to the sale price of the product, hence this is why fair trade certified goods are more expensive than regular products. For restaurants and other food vendors that only use fair trade certified goods, their consumers may not be used to paying the higher prices that come with that product (Alsever, 2006). Many consumers do not understand what fair trade means because it is not widely advertised, and many are on budgets, so the added cost may not be feasible for them. Thus, the added fees that fair trade certification requires can easily persuade a company or retail location not to choose this option.

Misinformation on labels does not apply to just the cocoa industry. Labels are designed to be catchy, easy to read, and contain only the necessary information. Manufacturers are careful with the wording they use in both advertisements and the labels on their products so that they provide enough information without telling the whole truth. A primary concern is that labels do not share where the ingredients originate. This idea goes back to the problem of traceability in supplies, as discussed in the first section. For example, Ferrero’s product Nutella only states on the label that the product is made with 13 percent hazelnuts (Whewell, 2019). Many products may contain small amounts of goods that were produced by forced labor without a consumer realizing it. This information is not communicated to consumers, nor do all workers fully understand what fair trade certified means (Alsever, 2006). Consumers are looking to purchase products with good intentions; however, labels pose more challenges due to their lack of information or misinformation.

It can be overwhelming to see how one can make a difference in a multi-million-dollar industry. With every change, it always starts with one person. This change could be deciding to try a new product that is fair trade certified, instead of a product with a known brand label that you, as a consumer, consistently choose to purchase. Although there are evident problems with fair trade, this solution is better than purchasing from big-name leaders in the industry. By continuing to purchase from the leading companies, consumers are only encouraging their corrupt practices and injustices within their supply chain. Once there is a shift towards fair trade goods, then the problems with fair trade and how farmworkers do not benefit from the premiums can be addressed. Many steps have to take place to raise awareness and highlight the flaws within the cocoa industry; however, consumers are the first step to take action.

For consumers to be leaders in this industry, they can take action by researching and learning more about the cocoa industry or initiatives that promote change. Farmworkers do not have a voice in this industry, and farmers are only beginning to have power now. This problem leaves consumers as the ones to stand up for them. As more people communicate and become educated on social injustices, efforts will begin that create new organizations and plans. People will become outraged, and that will work its way up to governments and cocoa industry leaders—forcing them to respond. If change is going to happen, pressure from the majority is essential because there is strength in numbers. Although it is a slow process with many obstacles, change can happen, and it all starts with one decision from an average person.

References

- Alsever, J. (2006, March 19). *Fair prices for farmers: Simple idea, complex reality*. Retrieved March 29, 2020, from <https://www.nytimes.com/2006/03/19/business/yourmoney/fair-prices-for-farmers-simple-idea-complex-reality.html>
- Bales, K. (2007). *Ending slavery: How we free today's slaves*. University of California Press.
- Bureau of International Labor Affairs. (n.d.-a). *Child labor, forced labor & human trafficking*. Retrieved January 8, 2020, from <https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/our-work/child-forced-labor-trafficking>
- Bureau of International Labor Affairs. (n.d.-b). *Findings on the worst forms of child labor – Ghana*. Retrieved March 29, 2020, from <https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/resources/reports/child-labor/ghana>
- Charles, D. (2019, July 1). *Fair trade helps farmers, but not their hired workers*. Retrieved April 21, 2020, from <https://www.npr.org/sections/thesalt/2019/07/01/736721302/fair-trade-helps-farmers-but-not-their-hired-workers>
- Chocolate Manufacturers Association. (2016, October). *Protocol for the growing and processing of cocoa beans and their derivative products in a manner that complies with ILO Convention 182 concerning the prohibition and immediate action for the elimination of the worst forms of child labor*. Retrieved April 4, 2020, from https://cocoainitiative.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/10/Harkin_Engel_Protocol.pdf
- Clausen, L. B. (2015, June 16). *Taking on the challenges of health care in Africa*. Retrieved April 19, 2020, from <https://www.gsb.stanford.edu/insights/taking-challenges-health-care-africa>
- Cocoa Initiative. (2016, September). *Cocoa farming: An overview*. Retrieved March 27, 2020, from https://cocoainitiative.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/ECA_-_2011_-_Cocoa_Farming_an_overview.pdf
- C029 - Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29). (n.d.). Retrieved January 7, 2020, from https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_ILO_CODE:C029#A29.
- C138 - Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138). (n.d.). Retrieved January 8, 2020, from https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_ILO_CODE:C138.
- C182 - Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182). (n.d.). Retrieved January 9, 2020, from https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_ILO_CODE:C182.

- Fair Trade USA. (n.d.-a). *Fair trade global model*. Retrieved April 4, 2020, from <https://www.fairtradecertified.org/why-fair-trade/our-global-model>
- Fair Trade USA. (n.d.-b). *Fair trade certified*. Retrieved April 4, 2020, from <https://www.fairtradecertified.org/>
- Fair Trade USA. (n.d.-c). *Why fair trade - why buy fair trade*. Retrieved April 4, 2020, from <https://www.fairtradecertified.org/why-fair-trade>
- Fairtrade Foundation. (n.d.-a). *Cocoa farmers*. Retrieved January 24, 2020, from <https://www.fairtrade.org.uk/Farmers-and-Workers/Cocoa>
- Fairtrade Foundation. (n.d.-b). *Fairtrade premium*. Retrieved April 21, 2020, from <https://www.fairtrade.org.uk/What-is-Fairtrade/What-Fairtrade-does/Fairtrade-Premium>
- Ferrero. (2019, June 6). *Ferrero takes action against child labour*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://www.ferrero.com/news/Ferrero-Takes-Action-Against-Child-Labour>.
- Food Empowerment Project. (n.d.). *Child labor and slavery in the chocolate industry*. Retrieved April 4, 2020, from <https://foodispower.org/human-labor-slavery/slavery-chocolate/>
- Fortune Business Insights. (2019, April). *Cocoa and chocolate market size, share: Global report 2025*. Retrieved April 8, 2020, from <https://www.fortunebusinessinsights.com/industry-reports/cocoa-and-chocolate-market-100075>
- Fountain, A., & Huetz-Adams, F. (2018). *Cocoa barometer 2018*. Creative Commons License, Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International. Retrieved from <https://www.voicenetwork.eu/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/2018-Cocoa-Barometer.pdf>
- History.com Editors. (2017, December 14). *History of chocolate*. Retrieved January 13, 2020, from <https://www.history.com/topics/ancient-americas/history-of-chocolate>.
- International Cocoa Initiative Foundation. (2016, October 11). *Child labour monitoring and remediation system*. Retrieved April 1, 2020, from <https://cocoainitiative.org/knowledge-centre-post/3043/>
- International Labour Organization. (2011, July 8). *Africa: Child labor in cocoa fields/ Harkin-Engel protocol*. Retrieved April 4, 2020, from https://www.ilo.org/africa/technical-cooperation/accel-africa/WCMS_159486/lang--en/index.htm
- International Labour Organization. (n.d.). *What is forced labour, modern slavery and human trafficking*. Retrieved January 7, 2020, from <https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/forced-labour/definition/lang--en/index.htm>

- Jaffe, D. (2018, December 5). *The essential importance of trust: How to build it or restore it*. Retrieved March 29, 2020, from <https://www.forbes.com/sites/dennisjaffe/2018/12/05/the-essential-importance-of-trust-how-to-build-it-or-restore-it/#464f387c64fe>
- Lawler, N. E., Mundt, J., Comhaire, J. L., & The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica. (2019, October 4). *Settlement patterns*. Retrieved January 24, 2020, from <https://www.britannica.com/place/Cote-dIvoire/Settlement-patterns#ref55126>
- Leissle, K. (2018). *Cocoa*. Medford, MA: Polity Press.
- Leonard, M. & Berlan, A. (2009), Child labour and cocoa: whose voices prevail?, *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 29(3/4), 141-151. <https://doi.org/10.1108/01443330910947516>
- Lepley, S. (2019, May 30). *9 mind-blowing facts about the US farming industry | Markets insider*. Retrieved March 28, 2020, from <https://markets.businessinsider.com/news/stocks/farming-industry-facts-us-2019-5-1028242678#while-there-are-more-than-2-million-farms-across-the-us-farmers-and-ranchers-make-up-just-1-3-of-the-labor-force-2>
- Lewis, R. (2017, May 1). *Hershey company*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://www.britannica.com/topic/Hershey-Chocolate-Corporation>.
- Lindell, C. (Ed.). (2019, January). *2019 global top 100 candy companies: Part 1: candy industry*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://www.candyindustry.com/2019/top-25-candy-companies>.
- Living Income Practitioners' Workshop hosted by ISEAL & GIZ, Eschborn. (2015, February). *Living income resources*. Retrieved January 27, 2020, from <https://sustainablefoodlab.org/performance-measurement/tools-resources/living-income/>
- Marston, A. (2016, March). *Women's rights in the cocoa sector: Examples of emerging good practice*. Retrieved March 26, 2020, from https://www.oxfamamerica.org/static/media/files/Womens_Rights_in_the_Cocoa_Sector_paper.pdf
- Meiji Co., Ltd. (n.d.). *Story: Meiji the chocolate: Meiji co., Ltd*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://www.meiji.co.jp/sweets/chocolate/the-chocolate/en/story/>.
- Mull, L. D., & Kirkhorn, S. R. (2005). Child labor in Ghana cocoa production: focus upon agricultural tasks, ergonomic exposures, and associated injuries and illnesses. *Public health reports* (Washington, D.C. : 1974), 120(6), 649–655. <https://doi.org/10.1177/003335490512000613>

- Murray, U., & Khan, S. (2007). *Rooting out child labour from cocoa farms: Sharing experiences*. Geneva: ILO.
- National Museum of American History. (n.d.). *Chocolate-making conch*. Retrieved January 16, 2020, from https://americanhistory.si.edu/collections/search/object/nmah_1301436
- Nestlé. (n.d.). *The Nestlé company history*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://www.nestle.com/aboutus/history/nestle-company-history>
- Off, C. (2014). *Bitter chocolate: Anatomy of an industry*. New York: The New Press.
- Polaris. (2020, February 13). *2018 U.S. national human trafficking hotline statistics*. Retrieved April 8, 2020, from <https://polarisproject.org/2018-us-national-human-trafficking-hotline-statistics/>
- Rainforest Alliance. (n.d.). *About the rainforest alliance*. Retrieved April 4, 2020, from <https://www.rainforest-alliance.org/about>
- Ryan, Ó. (2012). *Chocolate nations living and dying for cocoa in West Africa*. London: Zed Books.
- Schrage, E., & Ewing, A. (2005). The cocoa industry and child labour. *The Journal of Corporate Citizenship*, 18. Retrieved from <https://link-gale-com.libproxy.albany.edu/apps/doc/A135662776/AONE?u=albanyu&sid=AONE&xid=e1e078c4>
- Singh, R. P., & Cook, L. R. (2018, November 1). *Cocoa*. Retrieved January 13, 2020, from <https://www.britannica.com/topic/cocoa-food>.
- Snoeck, D., Afrifa, A., Ofori-Frimpong, K., Boateng, E., & Abekoe, M. K. (2009) (2009). Mapping fertilizer recommendations for cocoa production in Ghana using soil diagnostic and GIS tools. *West African Journal of Applied Ecology*, 17. 97-107. Retrieved January 24, 2020, from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/259786164_Mapping_Fertilizer_Recommendations_for_Cocoa_Production_in_Ghana_Using_Soil_Diagnostic_and_GIS_Tools
- Sunday Adenrele Adeniyi. (2017). Development of a composite soil degradation assessment index for cocoa agroecosystems in southwestern Nigeria. *Solid earth*, 8(4), 827–843. <https://doi.org/10.5194/se-8-827-2017>
- The Editors of Chocoladefabriken Lindt & Sprüngli AG. (n.d.). *History*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://www.lindt-spruengli.com/about-us/history/>
- The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica. (2019, November 15). *Nestlé SA*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://www.britannica.com/topic/Nestle-SA>.

- The Editors of Mars, Incorporated and its Affiliates. (n.d.). *Cocoa for generations: Mars, incorporated*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://www.mars.com/sustainability-plan/cocoa-for-generations>
- The Editors of Meiji Holdings Co., Ltd. (n.d.). *History: Meiji holdings co., Ltd*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://www.meiji.com/global/about-us/history/>
- The Editors of Mondelez International. (2019, May 14). *Human rights due diligence and modern slavery report 2018*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from https://www.mondelezinternational.com/~/_media/mondelezcorporate/uploads/downloads/mdlz_human_rights_report_2018.pdf?la=en.
- The Editors of Mondelez International. (n.d.). *About us: Mondelēz int*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://careers.mondelezinternational.com/about-us>
- The Editors of The Hershey Company. (n.d.). *Our Hershey's happiness history: Hershey's*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from https://www.hersheys.com/en_us/our-story/our-history.html
- The Minderoo Foundation Pty Ltd. (n.d.). *Cocoa: Global slavery index*. Retrieved January 24, 2020, from <https://www.globalslaveryindex.org/2018/findings/importing-risk/cocoa/>
- Tondo, L. (2019, December 20). *Ferrero rocher chocolates may be tainted by child labour*. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from <https://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2019/dec/20/are-ferrero-rocher-chocolates-tainted-by-child-labour>.
- Tony's Chocolonely. (n.d.). *Our mission*. Retrieved April 4, 2020, from <https://tonyschocolonely.com/us/en/our-mission>
- United Nations Human Rights. (2000. November 15). *Protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons especially women and children, supplementing the United Nations convention against transnational organized crime*. Retrieved December 26, 2019, from <https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/protocoltraffickinginpersons.aspx>
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (n.d.). *What is human trafficking?* Retrieved December 26, 2019, from <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/what-is-human-trafficking.html>
- United Nations Treaty Collection. (2003, December 25). *Status as at 04-08-2020: 12. a) Protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children, supplementing the United Nations convention against transnational organized crime*. Retrieved April 8, 2020, from https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=TREATY&mtdsg_no=XVIII-12-a&chapter=18&clang=_en

- United States Department of Homeland Security. (2019, June 28). *What is human trafficking?* Retrieved January 7, 2020, from <https://www.dhs.gov/blue-campaign/what-human-trafficking>
- United States Department of Labor. (2018). *Findings on the worst forms of child labor - Nepal*. Retrieved April 8, 2020, from <https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/resources/reports/child-labor/nepal>
- Verité, Inc. (2019, February). *Assessment of forced labor risk in the cocoa sector of Côte d'Ivoire*. Retrieved March 28, 2020, from <https://www.verite.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/02/Verite-Report-Forced-Labor-in-Cocoa-in-CDI.pdf>
- Whewell, T. (2019, September 19). *Is Nutella made with nuts picked by children?* Retrieved April 8, 2020, from <https://www.bbc.com/news/stories-49741675>
- World Cocoa Foundation. (n.d.). *Cocoa & forests initiative*. Retrieved April 4, 2020, from <https://www.worldcocoafoundation.org/initiative/cocoa-forests-initiative/>